Sprache und Welt
Language and World

Abstracts

32. Internationales Wittgenstein Symposium
9. – 15. August 2009
Kirchberg am Wechsel

32nd International Wittgenstein Symposium
August 9 – 15, 2009
Kirchberg am Wechsel

ON INTENSIONAL INTERPRETATIONS OF SCIENTIFIC THEORIES

Terje Aaberge, Sogndal, Norway

The picture theory from Wittgenstein's Tractatus logico-philosophicus provides a correspondence principle for the semantics of a formal language that in contrast to Tarski's extensional interpretation scheme, can be represented by maps from the domain to the language. It makes possible intensional interpretations of the predicates of the language of discourse for a domain consisting of physical objects or systems. The aim of this paper is to outline the basis for such an interpretation and explain how it can be extended to a language of discourse for the properties of the physical systems.

WITTGENSTEIN, DWORKIN AND RULES

Maija Aalto-Heinilä, Joensuu, Finland

In this paper I examine Ronald Dworkin's distinction between legal rules and principles with the help of Wittgenstein's remarks on rule-following. Dworkin's conception of legal rules as having an "all-or-nothing"-nature and as "dictating a result, come what may", seems to be a perfect example of the type of philosophical confusion about rules that Wittgenstein discusses in his Philosophical Investigations. Consequently, if one desires to distinguish rules from other types of legal standards, it would be best to focus on the distinct function of rules in legal reasoning (rather than on their supposed absolutely determinate nature).

TEXTS DO NOT REFLECT OUTER REALITY. WHAT DO THEY DO THEN?

Krzysztof Abriszewski, Toruń, Poland

The question "what do the scientific texts do?" is one of the aspects of the problem of language-reality relation. A realistic philosopher would say that the texts reflect outer reality. In my text, I argue, that this position is undefendable. I use four general models and several empirical observations from Science Studies to support my claim. While rejecting the mirroring metaphor, I propose four different metaphors that could help to answer the initial question: network assembling, reference circulating in circuits, activating and dis-activating, and representing.

AGAINST EXPRESSIONISM: WITTGENSTEIN, SEARLE, AND SEMANTIC CONTENT

Brandon Absher, Lexington, KY, USA

In this paper, I present Wittgenstein's criticisms of a group of popular theories, which I call "expressionism." Expressionist theories of meaning claim that means of representation (e.g. sounds) represent semantic content by virtue of their relation to mental states. In this paper, I show that even theories, such as John Searle's, that do not rely on phenomenal mental rules are subject to Wittgenstein's criticisms.

MODAL EMPIRICISM AND TWO-DIMENSIONAL SEMANTICS

Gergely Ambrus, Miskolc, Hungary

My lecture addresses the debate between modal rationalism and modal empiricism. According to modal rationalism, most generally put, what is conceivable, is possible. According to modal empiricism, what is possible, is a metaphysical fact, independent of conceptual capacities, i.e. what we can conceive of. This general debate has implications for some special metaphysical problems, e.g. for the consciousness-brain relation: modal rationalism is a precondition of the zombie-argument for dualism.

I will argue for modal empiricism. More precisely, I will argue that contrary to Chalmers' modal rationalist conviction, his views on the semantics and ontology of microphysical terms imply modal empiricism.

COMPOSITIONALITY FROM A "USE-THEORETIC" PERSPECTIVE

Edgar José Andrade-Lotero, Amsterdam, The Netherlands

What does it mean to say that language is a potential-infinite object, as opposed to an actual-infinite one? I want to inquiry into the notion of the infinite that could be attributed to language, in such a way that we move closer to an inquiry into language-understanding. Philosophers have attributed to language the property of actual-infinity. This has motivated the study of compositional theories of meaning. Compositionality is also supposed to solve the problem of productivity of language. I will argue that the assumption that languages are actual-infinite objects leads to insurmountable obstacles to putting the notion of understanding back into the picture –and therefore, that compositionality doesn't do the job it was hired for. I will follow instead the idea that it is fruitful to analyze the problem of productivity in a way parallel to Wittgenstein's discussion of the infinity of natural numbers.

EINE ÜBERPRÜFUNG VON NORMAN MALCOLMS BEMERKUNGEN ÜBER DIE VERWUNDBARKEIT UNSERER OBJEKTIVEN GEWISSHEITEN

José Maria Ariso, Kassel, Deutschland

Gemäß Norman Malcolm war Ludwig Wittgenstein der Meinung, dass drei Folgen aus unerhörten Ereignissen möglich waren. Erstens könnten die Grundlage alles Urteilens von einem bestimmten Subjekt entzogen werden; zweitens könnte Gewissheit durch Zweifel ersetzt werden; und drittens könnte sich das Subjekt dafür entscheiden, seinen alten Gewissheiten beizubehalten. Richard Scheer kritisierte die zwei letzten Möglichkeiten. Troztdem begründete Malcolm seine Meinung nicht; stattdessen beschränkte er sich, einige Texte Wittgensteins zu zitieren. In diesem Beitrag versuche ich also Malcolms Meinung gegen Scheers Kritiken zu begründen.

A DIGITALIZED TRACTARIAN WORLD

Sun Bok Bae, Seoul, Korea

I will discuss a possibility about the Tractarian project as philosophy of information. It was not actually evaluated that Wittgenstein made a great contribution to provide the logical background of the modern digitalized computer world through his theory of the 16 truth-grounds in the propositional logic. I argue that the language of 16 truth-grounds in TLP can be transformed into the same language of the discrete mathematics, if the truth values 'F' and 'T' are interpreted as the binary number '0' and '1' which are used from Leibniz to Boole. In conclusion I suggest that the language of a digitalized Tractarian world consists of the language of I-Ching, because the numerical meaning of 'yin' and 'yang' in I-Ching's symbol coincides completely with '0' and '1'.

WITTGENSTEIN AND SKEPTICISM ABOUT EXPRESSION

Stina Bäckström, Chicago, IL, USA

I argue that a neglected aspect of the later Wittgenstein's interest in the notion of expression is that it can help us see what is wrong with a pervasive conception of the epistemology of other minds. On the inferential model of our access to other minds, outer signs afford an inferential basis for attributing attitudes and feelings to others. By extending a discussion from Philosophical Investigations, I propose that conceiving of our knowledge of other minds as being—even its most paradigmatic form—based on inference fails to recognize the distinctive way in which expression affords knowledge. In a sense I will explain, the inferential model thereby qualifies as a form of skepticism about expression.

TRACTATUS LOGICO-PHILOSOPHICUS – THE INTRODUCTION OF THE ARCHETYPAL SIGN OF LOGIC

Diana Bantchovska, Durban, South Africa

This paper attempts to bring evidence that Wittgenstein's work is consolidated around a single idea: that language, reality, the world, human nature share one and the same logical structure. The focus is on the Archetypal sign of logic representing the Bipolar structure of logic, as introduced by the Tractatus. It establishes that the acknowledgement of the structure of logic is the end-point of our search for logical truths. Further notations are impossible for this structure stands for the only possible full description of reality.

LANGUAGE-USE AS A GRAMMATICAL CONSTRUCTION OF THE WORLD

Paulo Barroso, Braga, Portugal

The aim of this paper is to take into account possible answers to the following questions raised by the reading of Wittgenstein's remarks on the philosophy of psychology: how is the connection between public signs (e.g. ordinary words) and mental images established? In other words: why does a mental image have a certain meaning or refer to a given content? This topic supposes the linguistic expression and rests mostly on the general relation between subjectivity and privacy of experience and the public nature of language.

CRITIQUE OF LANGUAGE AND SENSE OF THE WORLD: WITTGENSTEIN'S TWO PHILOSOPHIES

Marco Bastianelli, Perugia, Italy

This paper does not deal with the usual distinction of Wittgenstein's philosophy of language into two phases, namely a first one, concerning the investigation of the logic of language, and a second one, dedicated to the description of language games and forms of life. I'd rather try to distinguish in Wittgenstein two kinds of philosophical activity: a technical one, oriented to language, which aims at understanding its functioning in order to avoid philosophical confusions; and a deep one, oriented to the subject who practises it, which results in a personal change in the way one sees the world. While Wittgenstein modifies his philosophy oriented to language, he does not change his philosophy of subject. Furthermore, these two activities are strictly connected to one another and reveal a deep unity in Wittgenstein's investigations.

FROM THE PROTOTRACTATUS TO THE TRACTATUS

Luciano Bazzocchi, Pisa, Italy

The final, unpublished section of Wittgenstein's so-called "Prototractatus" manuscript allows us to rebuild the gradual course he took to arrive at the definitive structure of the Tractatus. So that it's now possible to solve the remaining enigmas of the "Korrektur" cited by the author himself in the final pages of the Notebook. The text's continuity with the preceding parts confirms the top-down technique coherently followed by Wittgenstein in developing the logical tree of his composition.

CONSTRUCTIONS AND THE OTHER

Ondrej Beran, Prague, Czech Republic

The paper is an attempt to revise critically the analytical view on (negligence of) privacy and secrecy. The exposition relies on Lévinas' conception of ethics and the Other. Whereas for the post-analytical philosophy there is no private language and a person is who she is taken to be (by the other people), I try to show that there is a variety of certain real analogues of private languages, and that the concept of willing privacy points the distance to the Other, proposed by Lévinas. To doubt my own (mis)construction of my counterpart is not an epistemological enterprise, necessary for the functioning of the space of discourse, but an ethical admittance of the Other's being "end in itself".

OUR 'FORM OF LIFE' REVEALED IN THE ACTION OF LANGUAGE

Cecilia B. Beristain, Munich, Germany

The aim of the present paper is not to give an exegetic explanation of Wittgenstein's notion of form of life. It is instead, an attempt to understand the use of our language as action and how it works as an evidence of all that we are individually and collectively. I will show the parallel between the activity of using language and the way our world is shown as a form of life. The term 'form of life' is used here in the sense of a cultural and social environment with the aim to find a better explanation and sense behind our language.

LANGUAGE AS ENVIRONMENT: AN ECOLOGICAL APPROACH TO WITTGENSTEIN'S FORM OF LIFE

Pierluigi Biancini, Palermo, Italy

This paper works out a new way of seeing at the concept of Lebensform to show how it functions in establishing a new semantic approach in Wittgenstein. I show how the beginning of the PU could be read as a trial for the conversion to a new way of seeing the language-world connection. Wittgenstein eliminates the need for this link showing the ecology of the linguistic environment. The rhetoric of conversion is based upon two points: (i) the passage from language as an event to language as a process contained in the distinction in PI § 16 between Sprache and Wortsprache; (ii) the reflection on training in language and its foundational role. As suggested by the anthropologist Ingold training is a matter of dwelling the world, or of building it. Taking hints from the ecological literature and the philosophy of practical holism I give a positive account of the Lebensform.

SPRACHE ALS KONTINUUM, SPRACHE ALS ‚DISKRETUM' IN DER ARISTOTELISCHEN PHYSIK

Ermenegildo Bidese, Trient, Italien

Ziel des Beitrags ist zu zeigen, mit welchem Sprachverständnis Aristoteles im sogenannten Proömium seiner Physikvorlesungen (184a10-b14) operiert. Ausgehend von der erkenntnistheoretisch relevanten Frage, wie eine immer in Veränderung begriffene Wirklichkeit wissenschaftlich erfasst werden kann, wird durch die Analyse und die Interpretation des Textes gezeigt, dass Sprache hier einmal als undifferenziertes Kontinuum, ein anderes Mal als diskretes Relationsgeflecht verstanden wird. Obwohl ersteres nicht als wissenschaftliche Erkenntnis gilt, bildet es die Grundlage, auf der letzteres, sehr wohl wissenschaftliche Erkenntnis, fußt. In der unendlichen Bewegung der Wirklichkeit schafft Sprache somit eine erste Ebene, von der aus Philosophie überhaupt erst möglich ist.

THE 'LANGUAGE AND WORLD' OF RELIGION

Anat Biletzki, Tel Aviv, Israel

Of the several interpretative families of Wittgenstein's thought on religion—religion as "mystical," religion as experiential faith, religion as an attitude, religion as expression, etc.—the fideistic reading has received, it seems, the brunt of both supportive and critical discussion. Within this school there is an unintentional meandering between seeing religion as a language game and seeing it as a form of life, coupled with a general perception that these constructs manifest a similar, or even identical, understanding of what religion is. This article attempts to unravel the ensuing questions arising from the association of religion with language games and with forms of life. It asks whether there is a difference between describing religion as a language game (Words) and describing it as a form of life (World?). Showing that these are not the same, it goes on to inquire if one construct is more appropriate for the portrayal of religion than the other. The suggested reply is that the former (religion as a language game)is a misconstrued parallelism while the latter (religion as a form of life) provides profound insights into what Wittgenstein says about religion—and into religion itself. Beyond these distinctions, however, there is added value in viewing religion as a form of life (and even as a language game); not for the regularly cited uniqueness and singularity of the religious "point of view," but rather for its public, behavioral, and communal aspects.

CONCEPTUALIZING TECHNOSCIENCE IN A REASONABLE, CONSTRUCTIVIST WAY

Ewa Bińczyk, Toruń, Poland

The text presents a specific, "reasonable" version of constructivism, widely inspired by Bruno Latour`s actor-network theory and also other results of the so-called STS – science and technology studies. It pictures science and technology as both practically successful and historically institutionalized.

The article shows that constructivist position turns out to be especially promising when we analyze the role of scientific discoveries and technological innovations in the globalized world. The border parameters of our reality (understood as institutional, symbolic and also material context) are constantly transformed on such a large scale that only dynamic and anti-essentialist theoretical frameworks is able to grasp these processes. Thus, a reasonably projected constructivism is a theoretical background convenient to face political problems of the risk society today.

NEO-EXPRESSIVISM AND THE PICTURE THEORY

Nathanial Blower, Iowa City, IA, USA

In this essay I urge that any satisfactory neo-expressivist account of first-person authority has got to go hand-in-hand with a satisfactory account of 'meaning' as 'use'. I set out in section one how the neo-expressivist proposal is supposed to go. In section two I bring up a worry 'use theorists' (as opposed, e.g., to 'picture theorists') about meaning ought to have regarding a crucial aspect of the

new expressivism. And in the third section I bring up some worries anyone ought to have about neo-expressivist accounts of first-person authority, as long as such accounts are compatible with classical construals of the truth-conditions and truth-makers of psychological discourse (compatible, i.e., with an uncritical notion of 'objects standing in relations'). My conclusion will be that a proper account of the epistemology of avowals, while it does come by way of seeing their connections with natural expressions of mentality, will have to cast those expressions as formative of the very 'grammar'--literally, the meaning, in an honest sense of that word--of psychological ascriptions generally (first and third person).

INTERPRETATION OF PSYCHOLOGICAL CONCEPTS IN WITTGENSTEIN

Antonio Bova, Lugano, Switzerland

This paper aims to deepen what Wittgenstein says about psychological concepts. He replaces the notion of psychological facts and phenomena with the notion of psychological concepts, thereby placing the focus on an analysis of a conceptual nature. It is the instruments of grammar and linguistic games which provide a means to interpret psychological concepts reducing the description of internals states to the description of the use of the words that depict them. The psychological concepts therefore would take life only in the context of linguistic expression. Language is not conceived as a static image of logical rules far from real contexts of interaction, but rather as a living entity which transforms itself through its constant usage. Thus, the meaning of a psychological concept, like every linguistic expression, is contained in the use that is made of it.

WITTGENSTEIN ON REALISM, ETHICS AND AESTHETICS

Mario Brandhorst, Göttingen, Germany

This paper discusses some of the few but most interesting passages in which the later Wittgenstein discusses ethical language. As I will try to show, these passages are best read as suggesting an antirealist view of ethics. In order to support that interpretation, I consider passages from the 1938 lectures on aesthetics. They oppose aesthetic realism, and there are some further references to ethics, in particular to Moore. Rejecting realism, Wittgenstein seems to endorse a broadly expressivist interpretation of moral language, joined with a modest conception of truth. As the lectures on aesthetics show, there is room for further, more refined antirealist interpretations. Critical intentions are, however, primary: What unites his views on ethics and aesthetics is an uncompromising opposition to the realist idea that what is good, admirable or beautiful is so independently of the rules that we "laid down".

WITTGENSTEIN AND SELLARS ON THINKING

Stefan Brandt, Oxford, United Kingdom

I present Ludwig Wittgenstein's criticisms of the idea that meaningful linguistic utterances have to be accompanied by mental acts of thinking their sense and the idea that thinking occurs in a language of thought consisting of mental signs. I try to show that Wilfrid Sellars developed an account of thinking on the model of language which can accommodate Wittgenstein's challenges.

LANGUAGE AND THE WORLD

Nancy Brenner, Bilthoven, Netherlands

After the theory of evolution became the guiding paradigm of a scientific explanation of life, Descartes' fundamental distinction between body and mind was transformed into a distinction between nature and culture. The conception of the natural world remained the physical world, as Descartes saw it, but instead of the thinking mind being independent of the body came a culture independent of nature. The variety of languages came to be seen as 'cultural lenses' through which its users understand the world and act accordingly. And most important, while Descartes' postulated that reason, with its purpose to create true knowledge was the essence of the thinking mind, reason became the product of some cultures and not of others. While this transformation has led to cultural relativism, Donald Davidson's criticism of Quine's version of this view rejects this conclusion in a way reminiscent of Spinoza's naturalistic rejection of Cartesian dualism.

THE RISE AND FALL OF THE COHERENCE THEORY OF TRUTH

Stewart Candlish, Perth, Australia

In his 1989 book, The Coherence Theory of Truth: Realism, anti-realism, idealism, Ralph Walker attributed the coherence theory to various people, ranging from Spinoza to a temporal stage of Wittgenstein. I give a brief account of the origins of the idea that there is something properly called the 'coherence theory of truth', explicitly embraced by some philosophers and legitimately attributable to others. An examination of even the textbook 'coherence theorists' reveals that none deserves the label. Attempts to pin this label onto someone, even oneself, fail for good reason: ideas initially framed in coherentist jargon quickly mutate, as so-called coherence theorists, when put under the modest pressure involved in moving from slogans and rhetoric to the articulation of a theory, flee in different directions.

APPROXIMATING IDENTITY CRITERIA

Massimiliano Carrara / Silvia Gaio, Padua, Italy

Identity criteria are used to confer ontological respectability: Only entities with clearly determined identity criteria are ontologically acceptable. From a logical point of view, identity criteria should mirror the identity relation in being reflexive, symmetrical, and transitive. However, this logical constraint is only rarely met. More precisely, in some cases, the relation representing the identity condition fails to be transitive. We consider the proposals given so far to give logical adequacy to inadequate identity conditions. We focus on the most refined proposal and expand its formal framework by taking into account two further aspects that we consider essential in the

application of identity criteria to obtain logical adequacy: contexts and granular levels.

MODEL-THEORETIC LANGUAGES AS FORMAL ONTOLOGIES

Elena-Dragalina Chernaya, Moscow, Russia

My purpose in this paper is to interpret model-theoretic languages (abstract logics) as formal ontologies both in phenomenological and ontological engineering senses. The main idea of my approach is the interpretation of the classes of isomorphism as model-theoretic analogues of categorical objects of Husserl's formal region. Some principles of demarcation of the bounds of logic as formal ontology are discussed. This discussion is focused on the question: "Is the permutation invariance criterion necessary and sufficient for the demarcation of the bounds of logic as formal ontology?"

LANGUAGE AND RESPONSIBILITY

Anne-Marie S. Christensen, Odense, Denmark

In this paper, I develop a general implication of a Wittgensteinian view of language, namely that all instances of language use involves an element of freedom and thus of personal responsibility. In the first section, I unfold the background for this idea while I in the second look at how we distinguish between the responsibilities we face in language.

SIDESTEPPING THE HOLES OF HOLISM

Tadeusz Ciecierski / Piotr Wilkin, Warsaw, Poland

In our paper we attempt to achieve two goals: one of providing a more explicit characterization of holism and the other of showing that holism about confirmation and holism about meaning are less attractive positions than it is often presupposed. In the course of accomplishing the first task we distinguish two theses strictly connected with holism – one which we call the Contingency Thesis and the second one called the Degrees of Holistic Involvement Thesis. Both theses are used in arguments against holism sketched in the final parts of our paper.

WITTGENSTEIN'S NON-EXPLANATORY 'CRAVINGS', 'DISCOMFORTS' AND 'SATISFACTIONS'

Frank Cioffi, Kent, United Kingdom

Wittgenstein questions the pertinence of empirical enquiry to a wide range of psychological, aesthetic and historical problems. What those cases in which Wittgenstein denies a role to empirical enquiry have in common is not that the phenomena are necessarily empirically inexplicable but rather that explicability is not what is wanted. What is wanted is a clearer sense of the significance the phenomena have for us and, where appropriate, relief from the disturbance they cause.

Wittgenstein's most fundamental predilection is the prioritising of discourse in which issues can be resolved without recourse to matters not already known to the participants and of which they only need be reminded.

Wittgenstein's suggestion that information-gathering and information-frequenting activities often have a deluded rationale has been found by some to be apposite and emancipating. But there are many who will feel that you misrepresent their situation if you don't give prominence to their craving for causal knowledge and causal narratives and for their need to reconcile themselves not just to inarticulacy but to vulgar causal ignorance.

Why then should Wittgenstein's anti -explanatory remarks nevertheless be attended to and circulated? Because some whom they reach will find liberating the notion that though much of the darkness in which they live is the darkness of vulgar empirical ignorance, this awareness must be complemented by acknowledgement of an inadequate grasp of their perplexities and their frequent misperception of them as predominantly matters which further information could resolve. Wittgenstein's remarks are best taken as flaschenpost uttered in the hope that they will incite some whom they reach to know their own minds better.

FROM THE METHOD TO METHODS

James Conant, Chicago, Illinois, USA

I trace a development from Wittgenstein's early conception of *the* method of philosophy to his later conception of there being a series of method*s*. I argue that this change in his thought developed very gradually, with the major break coming in 1937.

TRACTATUS 6.3751

João Vergílio Gallerani Cuter, Brasilia, Brazil

It is easy to show that, in the Tractatus, colour ascriptions cannot be elementary propositions. But it is not so easy to determine which kind of analysis could be made of judgments of perception like "a is red". Wittgenstein gives us a kind of hint on aphorism 6.3751. He asks the reader to keep in mind the way we deal with the mutual exclusion of colours within the realm of physics. Even so, it is difficult to determine what exactly he is trying to say. I offer an interpretation that links the colour exclusion problem with the treatment given to numbers and the notion of "series of forms" (Formenreihe). Some passages of the Philosophische Bemerkungen are used to bring some support to this line of thought.

SOCIAL EXTERNALISM AND CONCEPTUAL FALSEHOOD

Bolesław Czarnecki, Cracow, Poland

According to Tyler Burge my belief about arthritis is consciously accessible and inferentially integrated with my other beliefs about it, i.e., being aware of the content of my 'arthritis' belief enables me to make various inferences across the network of other accessible beliefs. Some of these beliefs are true, other are false but they all affect the way I conceive of arthritis. Given a community of experts

whose beliefs about arthritis are all true, my concept of arthritis must differ from theirs. I shall demonstrate that social externalism, the most appreciated version of externalism about mental content, yields a very peculiar consequence that conceptual falsehood does not matter at all in determining the content of our beliefs. Specifically, according to social externalism even if a concept is misapplied, then merely in virtue of one's willingness to adhere to the correct usage and despite the misapplication, one is in the possession of the right concept.

PERCEPTION, LANGUAGE AND COGNITIVE SUCCESS

Tadeusz Czarnecki, Cracow, Poland

I compare three types o perception: perception X, perception as…, and perception that… to decide which type is cognitively the most promising. Commonly, perception that… is taken to be epistemically superior as both propositional and factive. I argue in favour of perception as… which implies revealing new aspects. I analyze two standard cases: the 'bent stick' illusion and the 'duck-rabbit' picture to explain how seeing new aspects engages language usage, transcends factivity and becomes heuristic.

THERAPY, PRACTICE AND NORMATIVITY

Soroush Dabbagh, Tehran, Iran

In this paper, firstly, it is shown that the standard account of the concept 'practice' in the Wittgenstein's philosophy is a therapeutic one. According to this account, the normative standard of the rightness and wrongness of word use cannot be put into words. This account can be seen as the negative aspect of the whole idea of normativity. Secondly, I argue that therapy alone is not adequate. In order to give a plausible account of the whole idea of normativity, the positive aspect of the concept 'practice' has to be presented. Thirdly, I suggest that distinguishing between the first order and the second order account of the concept 'practice' might be a way of explaining the positive aspect. According to the first order account, the constituents of the concept 'practice' have to be given. The second order account sketches out the idea that practice goes all the way down. Our confrontation with things in the world is based upon doing rather than theorising at the very basic level. Overt activities ultimately depend on mental activities.

HOW THE CATEGORY OF EMBODIMENT TRANSFORMS THE PROBLEMS OF PHILOSOPHY OF THE LANGUAGE: THE CASE OF UNDERSTANDING

Aleksandra Derra, Toruń, Poland

The author introduces the category of embodiment as it has been formulated in a relatively new current of cognitive science known as 'embodied cognition' or 'embodied mind' in order to study the way it transforms selected problems of the philosophy of language. Dealing with vast, complex and complicated material overfilled with various theories she selects three, the most representative presentations of this category (neuronal, experiential-phenomenological, socio-cultural) and enumerates their most important features. In the next step she compares the traditional approach to language and the embodied one, pointing out basic differences. Finally, and in more detail she examines the problem of understanding and its reformulations in the light of embodied approach as it has been presented.

SPRACHE UND WIRKLICHKEIT IN NĀGĀRJUNAS MŪLAMADHYAMAKAKĀRIKĀ

Kiran Desai-Breun, Erfurt, Deutschland

Unsere Begriffe von der Wirklichkeit sind sprachlich verfasst. Die Realität, die wir uns durch unsere Sprache erschließen, ist jeweils unsere Realität. Wie verhält sie sich zur Sprache? Hat sie einen Sachgehalt, oder sie ist bloß ein sprachliches Gefüge? Gibt es eine objektive Wirklichkeit jenseits der Sprache? Anhand von Nāgārjunas Schrift Mūlamadhyamakakārikā erörtert der folgende Artikel dieses Verhältnis und zieht daraus Konsequenzen, die das angedeutete Verhältnis in eine existentielle Dimension rücken.

REFERENTIAL DESCRIPTIONS IN ATTITUDE REPORTS

Dušan Dožudić, Zagreb, Croatia

Ever since Donnellan suggested that definite descriptions are ambiguous as between referential and attributive use, the question of their ambiguity has been a matter of considerable controversy. In my paper I examine an argument in favour of Donnellan's distinction offered by William Lycan. Lycan claims that in some attitude reports we are forced to introduce the referential/attributive distinction in order to capture the natural reading of such reports. If he is right this is an interesting case for the distinction. I will give some reasons that could support Lycan's claim, together with some doubts that could undermine it.

THE DIFFERENTIATING ROLE PLAYED BY DOUBLE NEGATION IN LINKING LANGUAGE TO THE WORLD

Antonino Drago, Pisa, Italy

While scholars of linguistics continued to be prejudiced against the use of double negations, those of mathematical logic in the second half of 20th Century privileged the double negation law with respect to the excluded middle law in the role of differentiating classical logic from most kinds of non-classical logic. Doubly negated statements are easily recognised in several texts, in particular in texts belonging to the so-called "negative literature" (in theology, ethics and epistemology), but even in some scientific texts. I suggest a new typology of such statements. Most of such statements are not equivalent to the corresponding affirmative statements, because the latter lack evidence, i.e. are idealistic in nature and therefore belong to non-classical logic; hence, they introduce a new kind of reasoning. Then through a comparative analysis of the

said texts, I identify the main features characterising both a new kind of arguing - which relies upon ad absurdum arguments of the weak kind - and a different organisation of a theory from the deductive one.

CORRELATION, CORRESPONDENCE AND THE BOUNDS OF LINGUISTIC BEHAVIOR

Eli Dresner, Tel Aviv, Israel

In the first section of this paper I present a question that needs to be addressed by proponents of interaction oriented conceptions of language, but which is seldom acknowledged (let alone answered). The question is this: How should the boundary between linguistic and non-linguistic behavior be delineated? In the second part of the paper I appeal to Davidson's notion of triangulation (as applied in his account of the underpinnings of language) in order to answer this question. In particular, I argue that the notion of correspondence between language and world (even without facts to which true sentences correspond) can play a part in the solution of this problem.

SENSE-DATA AND SENSES

Michael Dummett, Oxford, United Kingdom

A RESPONSE TO CHILD'S OBJECTION TO COMMON-SENSE REALISM

Olaf Ellefson, Toronto, Canada

William Child (2002) has argued that one cannot tenably hold the middle ground between constructivism and platonism. In this paper, I will argue that by relying on Stroud's notion of 'naturalness', a common-sense realist position can be maintained that avoids the excesses of constructivism and the paradoxes of platonism.

THE MULTIPLE COMPLETE SYSTEMS CONCEPTION AS FIL CONDUCTEUR OF WITTGENSTEIN'S PHILOSOPHY OF MATHEMATICS

Mauro L. Engelmann, Belo Horizonte, Brazil

The multiple complete systems conception is perhaps Wittgenstein's most important insight concerning the philosophy of mathematics after the Tractatus. According to this conception, it is the invention of new systems complete in themselves, and not the accumulation of truths, that characterizes mathematics. I explain, first, that the multiple complete systems conception solidifies Wittgenstein's Tractarian Intensionalism (against Platonism and Intuitionism). Second, I present some of the difficulties that it implies (its 'paradoxical' consequences) and show how they might have determined some of the developments in Wittgenstein's philosophy of mathematics. These developments, I suggest, culminate in the idea that the conception is merely an "equally arbitrary" alternative to other conceptions.

UMFASST WITTGENSTEINS FRÜHER BILDBEGRIFF DAS LITERARISCHE BILD (BILDLICHES SPRECHEN)? / DOES WITTGENSTEIN'S EARLY CONCEPT OF PICTURE COVER LITERARY PICTURES (PICTORIAL SPEECH)?

Christian Erbacher, Bergen, Norwegen

If participants who do not understand German attend, the presentation will be in English.

This paper discusses how Wittgenstein's early concept of picture with its mathematico-graphical double-character relates to pictorial speech. It is investigated (a) whether there is a pictorial speech in the Logisch-philosophische Abhandlung (LPA) that can be distinguished from a theoretical speech, (b) how Wittgenstein uses literary pictures in LPA and finally (c) in how far the results suggest that the concept of picture presented in LPA covers literary pictures and might contribute to our understanding of pictorial speech.

UNDERSTANDING ARCHITECTURE AS INESSENTIAL

Carolyn Fahey, Newcastle, United Kingdom

The new Wittgensteinian reading is one characterised by its being inessential as it does not commit to any absolute notion. According to such a reading, our current method of defining architecture as "architecture" stands in direct conflict, as it is inherently essentialist in its very conception. To understand architecture as inessential is to re-conceive the notion 'architecture' allowing for multiple conflicting conceptions to co-exist simultaneously. Whilst a definition of architecture that defies entirely the conventional means is seemingly impossible, a description of what this image of architecture(s) may alternatively appear as is indeed possible. Understanding architecture as inessential effectively means accepting that an 'essence' is no more than an ideal notion. In reverting to the everyday rules and reasons of an architecture practice as giving knowledge for what architecture is, we are able to conceive of a multiplicity of architectures without in anyway conflicting, contradicting or compromising our individual knowledge and experience of our individual unique conceptions of architecture. Transgressing these boundaries, I argue, is problematic.

CAVELL ON THE ETHICAL POINT OF THE INVESTIGATIONS

Matteo Falomi, Rome, Italy

The paper presents an overview of Cavell's account of the ethical significance of the Investigations. I focus on Cavell's reading of Wittgenstein's vision of language, emphasizing how such reading makes room for a peculiar notion of responsibility. I then connect this idea of responsibility with Cavell's description of perfectionism, showing thereby how Cavell's account of Wittgenstein's vision of language may imply a moral dimension. I conclude by arguing that the moral point of the practice of elucidation that Wittgenstein proposes in the Investigations might be understood on the background of this account.

SEMIOTISCHE DREIECKE ALS PROBLEM FÜR DEN RADIKALEN KONSTRUKTIVISMUS

August Fenk, Klagenfurt, Österreich

Für Saussure sind die beiden Seiten des sprachlichen Zeichens – Vorstellung (Bezeichnetes) und Lautbild (Bezeichnung) – „gleichermaßen psychisch", womit er laut Ogden & Richards den Interpretationsprozess ins Zeichen hinein verlegt und jene Dinge negiert, für welche das Zeichen steht. Glasersfeld (1982) hingegen sieht Saussure auf dem richtigen Wege und das semiotische Dreieck von Ogden & Richards als Simplifizierung und als Zugeständnis an den radikalen Behaviorismus. Die vorliegende Analyse kommt nach einer Auseinandersetzung mit diesen und anderen psycholog(ist)ischen Modellen zu dem Schluss, dass Saussures Modell die Phänomene der Lautsymbolik unterschätzt und dass der Ansatz von Glasersfeld die tatsächlich vorhandenen Differenzen überzeichnet (I), die Terminologie verkompliziert (II) und letztlich dennoch folgenlos bleibt (III). Wäre der Behaviorismus nicht – ganz im Unterschied zum Konstruktivismus – ein auf empirische Prüfbarkeit abzielender methodischer Purismus, so könnte man den radikalen Konstruktivismus als Behaviorismus mit umgekehrtem Vorzeichen sehen: Dem Behaviorismus ist die Innenwelt die black box, dem Konstruktivismus die Außenwelt.

PHILOSOPHICAL PICTURES AND THE BIRTH OF 'THE MIND'

Eugen Fischer, Norwich, United Kingdom

In his Big Typescript and contemporaneous sources, Wittgenstein moots the ideas that philosophical reflection is decisively shaped by analogies within language 'at work in the unconscious' and that philosophical perplexities can be resolved by tracing them back to such 'false pictures'. This paper develops and vindicates these ideas with the help of recent findings from cognitive linguistics and cognitive psychology, and a case-study on the early modern concept of the mind as a realm of inner perception, which gave rise to classical mind-body problems.

ÜBER DAS UNAUSSPRECHLICHE BEIM FRÜHEN UND SPÄTEN WITTGENSTEIN

Florian Franken, Berlin, Deutschland

The early Wittgenstein determines the religious as the mystical one about which you cannot talk, because he identifies it with the logical form of a proposition which can only be shown, but cannot become a topic itself. This semantic conception is based on ontological assumptions which must be taken to get a unique-reference theory and difference-criteria to appropriate what makes sense and nonsense. By changing the linguistic conception, the Wittgenstein of the Philosophical Investigations no longer supposes ontological objects, but sets the focus on the usage of language. Talking about objects within the world in a reasonable way is now guaranteed through a high network of „Sprachspielen,". By changing the semantic conception, it can be shown that the conception of the religious has been changed, too. It is not located in the conditions of a logical symbolism anymore, but has to be located within the practice of language, i.e. its execution.

IS 'A = A' APRIORI?

Wolfgang Freitag, Konstanz, Germany

There are two theses associated with Frege's puzzle of informative identity, namely, (1) there are informative and noninformative identities, and (2) identities of the form 'a = b' are informative, while those of the form 'a = a' are not. It will be argued that (2) is false. 'a = a' and 'a = b' may be equally informative. This will be shown to lead to a problem different from the problem of informativity: a sense will be unable to determine the reference of a name.

DAS WESEN DER NEGATION

Georg Friedrich, Graz, Österreich

Was entspricht dem linguistischen Phänomen der Negation in der Welt? Der Ausgangspunkt, der mir geeignet scheint, um diese Frage zu beantworten, ist das so genannte Problem der negativen singulären Existenzsätze. Dieses Problem besteht darin, dass aus einem Satz, der die Existenz irgendeines Gegenstandes verneint, unter bestimmten Voraussetzungen zu folgen scheint, dass dieser Gegenstand existiert. Das Problem der negativen singulären Existenzsätze scheint wesentlich mit der Frage verknüpft zu sein, ob Existenz ein logisches Prädikat ist oder nicht. Lässt man diese Frage offen, kann man zu einer Lösung des Problems der negativen singulären Existenzsätze kommen, nach welcher die Negation in einer ungewöhnlichen Weise zu interpretieren ist. Es wird sich dabei zeigen, dass die Negation einerseits als Satznegation und andererseits als Teil der Metasprache anzusehen ist.

WITTGENSTEIN REPUDIATES METAPHYSICAL CHATTER, NOT METAPHYSICS PER SE

Earl Stanley B. Fronda, Quezon City, Philippines

The concern of (the mature) Wittgenstein as a philosopher is language, not ontology (or metaphysics, if that means an inquiry into the depths of reality). According to his anthropological linguistics, the reality that humans can be cognizant of is constituted by the human organic form of life. Yet there is no denying that there is reality per se, a reality independent of humans. It is just that reality per se is transcendent to human interest. Such a transcendent realm lies beyond the limits of language, and as such cannot be spoken of. Speaking of that which cannot be spoken of is metaphysical chatter: a chatter that, as it were, bumps against the limits of language. Consigning the transcendent to silence is called for. While Wittgenstein affirms there is that which is transcendent, such is, for him, better left unspoken.

A STUDY IN BI-LOGIC (A REFLECTION ON WITTGENSTEIN)

Tzu-Keng Fu, Bern, Switzerland

In this paper, we present two of Wittgenstein's propositions in Tractatus Logico-philosophicus with the consideration of Matte Blanco's theory (MBT) on Unconscious Logic. By studying these two propositions, we could reinterpret Wittgenstein's observation on world from a psychoanalytic point of view.

PHENOMENAL CONCEPTS AND THE HARD PROBLEM

Martina Fürst, Graz, Austria

The Phenomenal-Concept-Strategy (PCS) is considered as a powerful physicalist response to the hard problem (Chalmers 1995). The hard problem is caused by the phenomenal aspect of consciousness and is contrasted with the alleged easy problem to which its cognitive aspect gives rise. The hard problem has been argumentatively elaborated in well-known arguments such as the knowledge argument (Jackson 1986) or the conceivability argument (Block 1980).

The PCS aims at giving an answer to these anti-physicalist arguments. The basic idea is to rely on phenomenal concepts which should explain why we draw dualistic conclusions of these arguments. Therefore, the target of this strategy is to give a satisfactory account of dualistic intuitions without drawing ontological dualistic conclusions.

I elaborate the PCS concentrating on the knowledge argument and offer an account of phenomenal concepts which captures their decisive uniqueness and explains their cognitive role. Subsequently, I demonstrate that an adequate account of phenomenal concepts implies phenomenal referents and hence the PCS fails to solve the hard problem.

REALISMUS, ONTOLOGIE UND SPRACHABHÄNGIGKEIT

Volker Gadenne, Linz, Österreich

Vertreter eines metaphysischen Realismus lehnen gewöhnlich die Annahme ab, dass die Welt eine Konstruktion sei oder dass unsere Erkenntnis der Welt in einem gewissen Sinne sprach- oder theorieabhängig sei. Nun ist es aber kaum zu bestreiten, dass Wahrnehmung und Kognition konstruktive Prozesse sind. Die entscheidende Frage ist, ob der konstruktive Charakter der Kognition mit der Annahme verträglich ist, dass wir Erkenntnisse über eine unabhängige, an sich existierende Welt haben. Die letzte Annahme lässt sich in mehrere Punkte gliedern, die getrennt zu prüfen sind: Ist z.B. die weiter gehende These gerechtfertigt, dass die Welt unabhängig von Sprache und Kognition eine bestimmte Struktur hat (also eine "fertige" Welt darstellt), selbst wenn wir diese nicht herausfinden können? Als entscheidend erweisen sich dann die beiden folgenden Fragen: 1) Ist es gerechtfertigt, eine bestimmte wissenschaftliche Theorie ihren Konkurrenten unter dem Gesichtspunkt der Wahrheit vorzuziehen? 2) Und ist eine solche rationale Präferenz auch bei ontologischen Theorien möglich? Ein erkenntnistheoretischer Realismus setzt voraus, dass zumindest die erste Frage bejaht wird. Und nur ein Realist, der beide Fragen bejaht, hat Grund, die These einer Sprach- bzw. Theorieabhängigkeit der Welt zurückzuweisen.

ASPECTS OF MODERNISM AND MODERNITY IN WITTGENSTEIN'S EARLY THOUGHT

Dimitris Gakis, Amsterdam, Netherlands

In the present paper I discuss aspects of Wittgenstein's early thought in the light of modernism and modernity. Starting from those elements of Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus that emit a certain modernist appeal, I move to a discussion of features of modernity - namely, scientism, essentialism and dogmatism - that can be attributed to Wittgenstein's early work. I consider these features to constitute part of the shared agenda between modernism and modernity and I thus view the Tractatus as an exemplar of a work where modernism and modernity, despite their often antagonistic relation, converge. This view challenges the picture of a continuity regarding Wittgenstein's anti-modernity stance, with anti-scientism being its cornerstone. At the same time, it stresses the need for qualification of attempts to characterize Wittgenstein as a modernist or (anti)modernity thinker.

ON THE ORIGIN AND COMPILATION OF 'CAUSE AND EFFECT: INTUITIVE AWARENESS'

Kim van Gennip, Groningen, Netherlands

This paper scrutinises the relation between 'Cause and Effect: Intuitive Awareness' and the source text, MS 119. There are two reasons that necessitate this task; first, 'Cause and Effect' omits an entry that is of crucial importance to Wittgenstein's philosophising as it developed in the late 1930s. Second, the source text enhances our understanding of the role and purpose of at least two long passages in 'Cause and Effect'. An elaboration of both these points improves our understanding of 'Cause and Effect' in particular and emphasises the need and necessity for transparent editorial procedures in editing Wittgenstein's Nachlass in general.

WITTGENSTEIN WRANGLING WITH SKINNER: THEIR NEWLY DISCOVERED ARCHIVE IN TRINITY COLLEGE CAMBRIDGE.

Arthur Gibson, Cambridge, United Kingdom

The majority of the archive is made up of dictation by Wittgenstein, to Skinner, and notes taken by Skinner at Wittgenstein's lectures, with revisions by Wittgenstein. That the former are comparable to the dictations included in von Wright's catalogue raises them to the level of Nachlass material. It could be argued that, since they are in (written) manuscript with quite substantial correction and revision by Wittgenstein, this elevates them above the typescript Blue and Brown books in giving us an insight not

only into his thought but also into his methodology. In the light of the archive's illuminating new material, the basis for fresh insights into Wittgenstein's philosophical dictation thought-processes, and his approaches to mathematics, the Skinner archive ranks as one of the most exciting discoveries in Wittgenstein studies since von Wright first published his catalogue of the Nachlass in 1969.

THE PHILOSOPHICAL PROBLEM OF TRANSPARENT-WHITE OBJECTS

Frederik Gierlinger, Vienna, Austria

The paper discusses the problem of transparent white as posed in Wittgenstein's Remarks on Colour. A number of objections to the claim that nothing can be both transparent and white are considered and rejected as deficient on the ground of not apprehending the nature of the problem. Affirmative views are shown to fall short of a solution in the same respect. An attempt is made to clarify the nature of the problem and identify its implications and philosophical importance.

NON-SUBSTITUTIVITY AND THE TANNEY PUZZLE

Lawrence Goldstein, Kent, United Kingdom

If you know the movie Superman, you will probably agree that it is true that Lois kissed Superman before she kissed Clark Kent. But Clark Kent is identical with Superman. Yet obviously Lois did not kiss Superman before she kissed Superman, so the argument to that conclusion is invalid. Yet it appears that there are arguments that share the form of the 'kissing Superman' one, but that are valid. Julia Tanney has remarked:

Normally, I would be very sympathetic with the claim that there was a time, t1, at which Lois kissed Superman but not (yet) Clark Kent. I note however that the sense in which Lois (at t1) had not (yet) kissed Clark Kent would be the same as that in which Oedipus, although having slept with Jocasta had not slept with his mother. But Jocasta hanged herself and Oedipus gouged out his eyes because there was no question for them of not accepting substitutivity.

The difference between the first (kissing) argument and the second is that, sexually, we have moved from second base to fourth, but that should not make for a difference in validity-value. Yet apparently the first argument is invalid, the second is valid. This is what I am calling the Tanney Puzzle. It provides an important testing ground for theories of reference. I want to show how this puzzle is resolved by attention to views that Wittgenstein expressed, at PI § 525 and elsewhere, about the influence of context on the proposition expressed by a speaker when using a sentence on an occasion.

PRIVATE SENSATION AND PRIVATE LANGUAGE

Qun Gong, Beijing, China

The issue of private language raised by Wittgenstein in his late work Philosophical Investigation（1953）is an important one open to long-term debating. Wittgenstein's private language argument which negatives it runs on discussing inner sensations, especially the "pain" in the human body. Is Wittgenstein argument successful or un-successful? My short paper argues that the Wittgenstein's argument is not successful. In order to explore the cause we need to begin from private sensation which is the starting point of the issue of private language in Wittgenstein.

THOUGHT EXPERIMENTATION AND CONCEIVABLE EXPERIENCES: THE CHINESE ROOM CASE

Rodrigo González, Santiago, Chile

This paper deals with a thought experiment that explores the nature of mind by conducting an operation that detects whether or not linguistic understanding takes place. In particular, I will address Searle's Chinese Room, and how this gedankenexperiment shows that this kind of understanding necessarily requires ascertaining the existence of a specific quale. In addition to being defined via deixis, like pain, the conscious experience that is the target of this thought experiment is detected by the first-person viewpoint of the mind. Although this crucial element has sparked a large number of criticisms as well as accusations of Cartesianism, it cannot be left out from the hypothetical situation that Searle's thought experiment envisages. For, as I will argue, most thought experiments on mental states take the mind as the laboratory in which hypotheses about its own nature are tested through conceivable experiences. As a result, the aforementioned accusations neglect how mental experimentation enables one to explore the mind as well as test hypotheses about its own nature.

THE ARGUMENT FROM NORMATIVITY AGAINST DISPOSITIONAL ANALYSES OF MEANING

Andrea Guardo, Milan, Italy

In his well-known essay on Wittgenstein, Saul Kripke maintains that dispositional analyses of meaning cannot work mainly because whereas the concept of disposition is descriptive, that of meaning is normative. Unfortunately, neither Kripke nor his followers have ever spelled out this "argument from normativity" in full detail. As a result, the argument does not have good press. This paper offers an explicit version of the argument. In particular, (1) I try to explain what the claim that meaning is normative amounts to, (2) I try to clarify what supports it, and (3) I sketch a valid version of the argument.

LANGUAGE AND SECOND ORDER THINKING: THE FALSE BELIEF TASK

Arkadiusz Gut, Lublin, Poland

Probably there is no philosopher, psychologist or linguist, who would not be intrigued by following question: How much of what is unique about the human mind is owed to language? One of the current hypotheses claims that public language is responsible for our ability to display

second order cognitive dynamics. To investigate the alleged role of language in second order dynamics I going to focus on the "child's theory of mind" and on "mind reading abilities". It will be stated that the real test as to whether a creature has a "theory of mind" rests on that creature's ability to understand that another person has a false belief. Evaluating series of experimental results (The false belief task) I will consider the strong claim that language is a necessary prerequisite for an acquisition of a meta-representational theory of mind and to display the ability to think about thoughts.

SCHOENBERG AND WITTGENSTEIN: THE ODD COUPLE

Eran Guter, Jezreel Valley, Israel

This paper is an elaborate response to Stanely Cavell's suggestion that Schoenberg's idea of the 12-tone row is a serviceable image of Wittgenstein's idea of grammar. I argue that this suggestion underplays what must be a major premise in any argument for yoking Wittgenstein and Schoenberg: Wittgenstein's philosophically entrenched rejection of modern music. I consider this omission in the context of Wittgenstein's idiosyncratic emulation of Schenker's theory of music in order to facilitate a direct comparison between Wittgenstein's and Schoenberg's sharply contrasted visions of the music of the future. I conclude that Cavell's suggestion is ultimately misleading.

A PROLEGOMENON TO WITTGENSTEIN'S ACCOUNT OF NECESSARY TRUTHS OF LOGIC, MATHEMATICS AND METAPHYSICS

Peter M. S. Hacker, Oxford, United Kingdom

RETURN TO AND OLD REFRAIN: WHAT PERSPICUOUS PROOF DOES AND DOES NOT DO TO CONCEPTS

Ian Hacking, Toronto, Canada

WITTGENSTEIN ON 'PRIMITIVE' LANGUAGES

Roy Harris, Oxford, United Kingdom

Is there anything of value to be salvaged from the notion of 'primitive' languages introduced by Wittgenstein in Philosophical Investigations? Setting up 'primitive' languages is evidently not an idle jeu d'esprit, but is intended to throw intellectual light on the mechanisms to be found in less 'primitive' languages, such as German, English, etc. Wittgenstein seems to have been pondering this idea since at least the early 1930s, since we find references to such languages 'complete in themselves' cropping up the Brown Book. There students are already invited to imagine such a language as 'the entire system of communication of a tribe in a primitive state of society'. But whether we can imagine this is not something that can be

taken for granted. It turns out that the linguistic competence required for the operation of a 'primitive' language involves rather more than perhaps Wittgenstein realized, at least if its users are to be regarded as engaged in a rational activity, and not merely as humanoid counterparts to Pavlov's dogs. As presented by Wittgenstein, the simplified semiology of such languages is a hindrance, rather than a help, to understanding the more complex semiology typical of human linguistic communication.

IAN HACKING ÜBER DIE SPRACHABHÄNGIGKEIT VON HANDLUNGEN UND DAS „ERFINDEN" VON LEUTEN

Rico Hauswald, Dresden, Deutschland

Ian Hacking hat argumentiert, zwischen den Humanwissenschaften und ihrem Forschungsgegenstand sei ein spezifisches Wechselspiel (er spricht von „Loopingeffekten") zu beobachten, das zur Folge hat, dass dieser Forschungsgegenstand nicht nur beschrieben, sondern fortwährend verändert wird: wenn den Menschen (den „Forschungsobjekten") neue sie betreffende wissenschaftliche Beschreibungen, Theorien, Klassifikationen usw. bewusst werden, so besteht die Möglichkeit, dass sie sich unter deren Einfluss verändern. Auf diesem Wege könnten ganz neue Personentypen („kinds of people") erschaffen, „erfunden" werden. Hacking stützt diese Behauptung auf ein handlungstheoretisches Argument, dem zufolge die Möglichkeit der Ausbildung eines bestimmten intentionalen Zustands davon abhängt, dass das Handlungssubjekt selbst über einen diesem Zustand entsprechenden Begriff verfügen müsse. Dieser Beitrag rekapituliert nun diese Argumentation und die an ihr geübte Kritik und verortet sie in einem größeren philosophischen Diskussionskontext. Ferner wird die Frage erörtert, welchen Personenbegriff Hacking eigentlich verwendet, wenn er von einem „Erfinden" von Leuten („making up people") durch Humanwissenschaften spricht.

'MEANING AS USE' IN PSYCHOTHERAPY: HOW TO UNDERSTAND 'YOU HAVE MY MIND IN THE DRAWER OF YOUR DESK.'

John M. Heaton / Barbara Latham, London, United Kingdom

Much of Wittgenstein's work was to show that there is an internal relation between language and world. Furthermore there is not a thinking subject who is independent of the language in which a subject represents some state of affairs. But most psychiatry, psycho-analysis, and cognitive therapy assume there is and base their therapy on it. We will discuss a patient who thought her mind was in the drawer of her desk to illustrate a different approach to therapy inspired by Wittgenstein's insight.

FORM – WIRKLICHKEIT – REPRÄSENTATION

Włodzimierz Heflik, Krakau, Polen

In diesem Referat analysiere ich den Begriff der Form der Wirklichkeit, wie er in Wittgensteins Tractatus auftritt. Diesen Begriff untersuche ich im Kontext der Unterscheidung von „Wirklichkeit" und „Welt". Ich weise hin auf die grundlegende Spaltung in Sprache und Wirklichkeit/Welt, deren Quelle das Subjekt ist. Die Form der Wirklichkeit ist das, was identisch ist; sie erweist sich als innere Relation, und das Subjekt nicht ihre Repräsentation hervorbringen. Ich plädiere für die transzendentale Interpretation des Tractatus.

MEANING AS A MATTER OF USE

Lars Hertzberg, Åbo, Finland

A variety of views have been attributed to Wittgenstein, by supporters as well as detractors, under the heading "meaning as use" or "use theory of meaning". In these accounts, the word "use" variously carries the sense of function or of usage. What is in question is sometimes the use of words, sometimes types of sentence, sometimes particular utterances. This variety itself is often overlooked, which may betray a lack of sensitivity to Wittgenstein's own concerns. Far from putting forward a rival account of meaning, Wittgenstein is steering us away from the idea that the understanding of linguistic communication requires some substantive account of meaning, whether in terms of mental contents, of reference, or of systematic features of the language. His appeals to use are meant to draw our attention to the way our understanding of a person's words is connected with what the speaker is doing on the particular occasion of speaking. The radical nature of this shift of perspective is often ignored. Even writers who acknowledge the importance of context often retain the idea of an underlying generality. The attempt to combine general rules with recognizing the significance of the particular case, however, leads to incoherence. The logical features of an utterance made in a particular situation cannot be established on the basis of word meanings and language rules. The discussion will be carried out in dialogue with James Conant, Alice Crary, Hans-Johann Glock, Charles Travis and others.

LANGUAGE CHANGE AND IMAGINATION

Christian Herzog, Klagenfurt, Austria

Taking up a remark from On certainty on alteration of meaning, a short account of Wittgenstein's position in respect of change in language is given, which results in two different perspectives on the subject of alteration in language use. Referring to passages from Philosophical Investigations a possible relation of imagination and alteration of meaning is discussed. Finally this question is related to accounts of metaphor given by Wittgenstein and Davidson, proposing a conception of metaphor as a linguistic practice, which evokes the involvement of imagination into the process of understanding.

WHAT IS THE PROBLEM ABOUT RULE-FOLLOWING?

Jakko Hintikka, Boston, MA, USA

The problem of how to follow a rule is logically speaking a question about dependence: What should one choose to do at each stage (say stage number n) depending on n? This question has the same logical form as an experimental question: How does the value $y = f(x)$ of the observed variable y depend on the controlled variable x? Nature's direct response, i.e. the outcome of the experiment, is a correlation of the values of x and y, as it were a curve on graph paper. But this "reply" does not answer the dependence question unless and until the inquirer knows what the function f is that the curve represents. Thus answering any dependence question involves two conceptually different tasks, not only to find the correlation but also to identify the function that the correlation is determined by. These tasks are largely independent of each other. Even knowing the precise curve does not automatically mean identifying the function whose graph it is. In the rule-following case, one can act in accordance with the rule in each case without being aware of the rule itself. Wittgenstein's original problem about rules is that of identifying the function rather than acting in accordance with it. The solution lies in recognizing how we identify in actual conceptual (including mathematical) practice different functions (rules).

A LEXICOLOGICAL STUDY ON ANIMAL FIXED EXPRESSIONS

Shelley Ching-yu Hsieh, Taipei, Taiwan

Compositionality is a universal characteristic of language (Brighton 2005: 13, cf. Wittgenstein 1953). This paper is a cross-language and cross-cultural study on animal fixed expressions (AEs) in German and Mandarin Chinese (MCh). This paper focuses on (1) investigating how the AEs in both languages are derived from the vehicles (animals); (2). mapping the metaphorical tenors (the meaning of the AEs) to the underlying conceit (the relation between the vehicle and the tenor) and (3). observing the lexical change, the linguistic and social functions of the AEs, and the language ideologies. The result reveals that AEs reflect people's relationship with animals and nature and provide language speakers a metaphorical way to express their social norms and emotions. They also show the different values and ways of thinking of the people with different cultural background. By studying AEs in different languages, we can learn and respect the value and philosophy of different cultures.

SPRECHEN ALS VERNÜNFTIGES HANDELN: GRUNDLAGE EINER RATIONALEN HERMENEUTIK

Peter Janich, Marburg, Deutschland

Wir machen uns gegenseitig für unser Sprechen ebenso verantwortlich wie für unser Handeln. Fragen und Antworten zu unserem (Sprech-)Handeln heißen vernünftig, wenn sie unter Symmetriebedingungen stattfinden und als solche gemeinschaftlichen Zielen von Kommunikation und Kooperation dienen.

Der Handlungscharakter des Sprechens erlaubt die Anwendung handlungstheoretischer Unterscheidungen wie Ge- und Misslingen (Handlungsvollzug entspricht Akteurs-Intention unter den Bedingungen geltender Regeln) sowie Erfolg und Misserfolg (Erreichen bzw. Verfehlen von Zwecken), die ein Verstehen und Anerkennen von Kommunikaten in einer Zweiparteien-Kommunikation zu definieren erlauben.

Eine methodisch geordnete Rekonstruktion von aufsteigend komplexer werdenden Kommunikationstypen (direktes Gespräch, Verschriftlichung, symmetrischer Dolmetscher zwischen verschiedenen Sprachen, Texte toter Autoren, Rekonstruktionen von Theorien) begründet eine rationale Hermeneutik als System von Kriterien zur Beurteilung der Qualität von Textinterpretationen nach besser und schlechter.

RE-DEFINING THE RELATION BETWEEN WORLD-PICTURE AND LIFE-FORM IN WITTGENSTEIN'S ON CERTAINTY

Joose Järvenkylä, Tampere, Finland

The aim of this paper is to examine the relation between Wittgenstein's notions of "World-picture" and "life-form" in On Certainty. My thesis is that "world-picture" is a logical concept, an instruction about the use of words. Unlike life-form, it is a bulk of axioms and rules which can be submitted under philosophical analysis. The idea according to which world-picture in its pre-propositional stage could be called life-form is first presented by von Wright who emphasises the epistemological relevance of the work. The rival interpretation is presented by Rush Rhees who in contrast stresses the logical aspects of the work. By suggesting both that world-picture is a logical concept and that life-form is related to it I will also present a way for combining these two readings.

HOW TO MAKE WITTGENSTEIN'S THEORY OF MEANING COMPLETE?

Ilya Kasavin, Moscow, Russia

The well-known Wittgenstein's expression sounds: «The use of the word *in practice* is its meaning» (Wittgenstein, L. 1978. The Blue and Brown Books. Oxford. P. 39.). This insight into the problem of meaning faces three challenges, namely, if this formula is 1) logically clear; 2) empirically probable; and 3) conceptually complete.

1) In order to understand this thesis we need to know the meanings of the words involved and to be able to operate with this sentence in communication. According to Wittgenstein, we cannot know the isolated meanings of the words. So everything what remains is to learn how to deal with this language construction without knowing initially what "use", "practice" and "meaning" are. It is evident that words are used in speech and in language in general. Is this a practice Wittgenstein had in mind? If yes, why he underlines then *the practical use* of the word in particular? What kind of practical use outside language can we imagine? So the expression "use in practice" is basically unclear unless we prescribe a solely emotional content to it, where word "practice" makes the word "language" sound stronger.

2) We presupposed that use of words is a speech act or any other linguistic *activity*. The Wittgenstein's idea of

meaning consists then in rejecting meaning as a stable mental state and treating it as a process, a change from one state to another. Either meaning is a *routine, circulating activity* or a *communicative innovation*, a mental or behavioral form of psycho-physiological activity, in any way meaning is an *activity*, and we have to agree with Wittgenstein in this point.

3) So the scheme proposed by the Wittgenstein's formula includes a linguistic agent, his activity and a word which thereby receives meaning. Is it an isolated agent or a participant in a collective language game? Is this game determined by some rules? Are these rules arbitrary or not? How do people master them? Do they understand rules in the same way? Is there anything outside language game that influences the meaning? All these questions reveal the necessity to go beyond the initial Wittgenstein's formula and problematize the concepts of mind, spirit, naming, meaning, use, language game, and appealing to other concepts as well. Can meaning be considered as something mental? Is meaning a kind of activity, its quality or function? Is meaning a kind of communication, its quality or function? Is meaning a kind of surrounding, its quality or function? So what is the key concept which can make the Wittgenstein's theory of meaning complete – this is the major issue of my paper.

METAPHYSICS OF THE LANGUAGE AND THE LANGUAGE OF METAPHYSICS

Serguei L. Katrechko, Moscow, Russia

Postulated by Kant, metaphysica naturalis roots in the language, in its metaphysics. Metaphysics of the language is connected with its sense (i.e. conceptual and categorial) and formal–structural nature. Metaphysics per se represents research of metaphysics of the language, i.e. is metaphysics of [language] metaphysics. The language of metaphysics has a not-denotative but a symbolic character. Metaphysical "objects" (concepts, symbols) possess maximum of sense, and act as transcendental conditions of this or that possible world. The meaning of philosophical symbols is specified by semantic (sense) language–games.

ZWEI DILEMMATA – MCDOWELL UND DAVIDSON ÜBER SPRACHE, ERFAHRUNG UND WELT

Jens Kertscher, Darmstadt, Deutschland

In Mind and World formuliert John McDowell ein für die neuzeitliche Erkenntnistheorie charakteristisches Dilemma, wonach diese unablässig zwischen den Polen eines uneingeschränkten Kohärentismus und dem Mythos des Gegebenen pendelt. Als Beispiel für das kohärentistische Horn des Dilemmas nennt McDowell die Position von Donald Davidson. Es wird gezeigt, dass die Behauptung, Davidsons Position führe zum Rückfall in den Mythos des Gegebenen, nicht überzeugt. Die Frage nach dem Verhältnis von Sprache und Welt löst Davidson im Rahmen seines externalistisch eingeschränkten Holismus als Antwort auf ein eigenes Dilemma, das durch einen skeptischen Einwand provoziert wird. Es zeigt sich, dass beide Autoren miteinander unverträgliche Ansätze in rechtfertigungstheoretischen Fragen aber auch hinsichtlich des Zusammenhangs von Erfahrungen und Überzeugungen vertreten.

JOHN DIVERS ON QUINE'S CRITIQUE OF DE RE NECESSITY

Antti Keskinen, Tampere, Finland

I discuss a recent answer to Quine's critique of quantified modal logic and de re necessity, proposed by John Divers. I argue that Divers' strategy of exposing a flaw in Quine's argumentation fails because the distinction between semantic and metaphysical issues on which Divers' strategy turns is not supported by Quine's philosophy. Because it fails to observe Quine's view of objects as theoretical posits, and simply assumes a contrary position concerning the nature of objects, Divers' answer misses its target.

FROM PRACTICAL ATTITUDE TO NORMATIVE STATUS: DEFENDING BRANDOM'S SOLUTION OF THE RULE-FOLLOWING PROBLEM

Matthias Kiesselbach, Potsdam, Germany

This essay discusses Robert Brandom's attempt to explain normative statuses in terms of practical attitudes. According to a standard criticism, the strategy faces a dilemma: if practical attitudes are specified in non-normative terms, then they can underwrite no more than mere regularity; but if they are specified using normative terms, then the strategy becomes viciously circular. This essay argues that the second horn of the dilemma can be neutralised in two steps. First, allow that multiple agents' practical attitudes can be jointly self-validating; second, interpret statements about normative statuses (including the theorist's statements about the appropriateness of practical attitudes) as themselves exhibiting practical attitudes. The circularity associated with this proposal does not attach to the explanatory strategy, but to the pragmatic system within which normative talk figures. In this essay, the proposal is applied to the normative phenomena of paper money circulation (value) and language (meaning).

SECOND THOUGHTS ON WITTGENSTEIN'S SECONDARY SENSE

Vasso Kindi, Athens, Greece

The paper criticizes aspects of Diamond's interpretation of Wittgenstein's "secondary sense" and offers a different account. It argues, in particular, that the cases discussed by Wittgenstein as involving a secondary use of words are supposed to challenge the view that meaning is use. Some of the cases are clear examples of synaesthesia where idiosyncratic experiences are linked to particular linguistic expressions, while other cases involve reference to inner processes. In both it seems as though something inner gives the words meaning. Wittgenstein's answer is that even in these cases, the meaning of words is parasitic upon their use in primary mode.

REALITY AND CONSTRUCTION, LINGUISTIC OR OTHERWISE: THE CASE OF BIOLOGICAL FUNCTIONAL EXPLANATIONS

Peter P. Kirschenmann, Amsterdam, The Netherlands

According to radical constructivist views, nothing we think or say has objective reality or validity. Realists oppose such views. Yet, in various domains, they face intriguing problems of separating substantial from mere human constructions. The problems I take up concern the status of biological functional ascriptions and explanations. Here, naturalist realists themselves are intent on eliminating any remainder of teleology, as being human projection.

I survey and assess the relevant debate in some detail. I point out that there are, and philosophers have defined, quite different notions of functions, depending on the questions to be answered, and that philosophers have neglected the kind of valid explanations ("design explanations") functional biologists are preoccupied with. I conclude that, next to this diversity of notions, it is the "normativity" or purposiveness involved in function ascriptions and functional explanations that makes it hard to attribute to them complete objective reality or validity.

ZUM PHAENOMEN DER SEMANTISCHEN NEGATIVITÄT: NIETZSCHE UND GERBER

Endre Kiss, Budapest, Ungarn

Die deutsche Sprachphilosophie der zweiten Haelfte des neunzehnten Jahrhunderts erlebt sich im Besitz von neuen und entscheidenden Erkenntnisse. Die Natur und der Ursprung dieser neuen Erkenntnisse ist divers, ihre Konsequenzen weisen aber in einer und derselben Richtung. Sie bringen grosse Anstrengungen auf, die Sprache in die Vermittlungskette eines erkenntnistheoretischen Gedankenganges unterzubringen, mit anderen Worten, sie tun alles, die Sprache in der nunmehr als endgültig gedachten Erkenntnistheorie zu positionieren. In dieser Grundbestrebung sehen sich die Vertreter dieser Richtung mit Kant konfrontiert.

Nietzsches Sprachreflexion entsteht auch in diesem historischen und strukturellen Kontext.

Nietzsche erkennt auch das differentielle Moment der Sprache. Er versucht es aber keineswegs, die so interpretierte Sprache in eine zentrale Position der extrem verlaengerten Vermittlungskette des Erkenntnisprozesses hineinzuzwingen. Er baut aber die Sprache vielschichtig, positiv wie negativ, in seine kritische Erkenntnistheorie, indem er diese mit einem komplexen theoretischen Ansatz der semantischen Negativitaet, sowie mit einer kreativen sprachschöpferischen Praxis bereichert.

Die daraus entstehende sprachliche Kreativitaet soll freilich nicht mit den vielen anderen „literarisch" organisierten Elementen von Nietzsches Philosophie verwechselt werden. Diese Sprachschöpfung ist höchstens nur sehr fern verwandt mit Nietzsches Gedichten, mit den Liedern des Zarathustra, mit der aphoristischen und deshalb literarisch anmutenden Intonation dieser Philosophie! Die semantische Negativitaet ist nur ein Moment aus der Vielfalt der scherwiegenden Probleme der philosophischen Kommunikation bei Nietzsche!

"DAS ERLOESENDE WORT"

James Klagge, Blacksburg, Virginia, USA

I survey the uses of this phrase by Wittgenstein and make a conjecture as to what the redeeming word was for him. Then, in light of this, I place Wittgenstein on a cultural-intellectual trajectory that includes Plato's Euthyphro, Job's God from the whirlwind, Dostoevsky's Father Zossima, and the Mormons.

MIND, LANGUAGE, ACTIVITY: THE PROBLEM OF CONSCIOUSNESS AND CULTURAL-ACTIVITY THEORY

Leszek Koczanowicz, Wroclaw, Poland

In my paper I show the relevance of cultural-activity theory for solving the puzzles of the concept of consciousness which encounter contemporary philosophy. I reconstruct the main categories of cultural-activity theory as developed by M.M. Bakhtin, L.S. Vygotsky, G.H. Mead, and J. Dewey. For the concept of consciousness the most important thing is that the phenomenon of human consciousness is consider to be an effect of intersection of language, social relations, and activity. Therefore consciousness cannot be reduced to merely sensual experience but it has to be treated as a complex process in which experience is converted into language expressions which in turn are used for establishing interpersonal relationships. Consciousness thus can be accounted for by its reference to objectivity of social relationships rather than to the world of physical or biological phenomena.

BEYOND MENTAL REPRESENTATION: DUALISM REVISITED

Zsuzsanna Kondor, Budapest, Hungary

In this paper, I suggest that the perennial endeavour to understand how language and thought work leads to a major recurrent fallacy: the introduction of new entities/conceptual variables with misleading and elusive functions, apparently helpful, but in the event difficult, or indeed impossible, to grasp. It is obvious that the oft-quoted mental discomfort felt by Wittgenstein is due to this kind of counterfeit invention. And in the momentous complementary case of Wilfrid Sellars, it becomes conspicuous that we have no chance at all to find a satisfactory way to provide a synoptic view of commonsensical versus scientific descriptions of the world within the framework of a traditional dualistic and verbalist approach. In a desperate attempt to step out of this framework, i.e. to connect mental and physical processes, I will focus on the notion of motor activity, relying on conceptual metaphor theory and the enactive approach in cognitive studies.

BERTRAND RUSSELL'S TRANSFORMATIVE ANALYSIS AND INCOMPLETE SYMBOL

Ilmari Kortelainen, Tampere, Finland

In my paper, I offer a more explicit definition of the interesting, but broad conception of "transformative analysis" at work in Bertrand Russell's "On Denoting" and "On Fundamentals". This is a comment to the discussion of the different ways to understand philosophical analysis in Russell's case. I begin by presenting how 'transformation' in the Russellian sense should be also understood from the point of view of contextualization of the paradoxical propositions. The idea that language is misleading from the world was a side effect, though an important one, of the OD. Secondly, I suggest that for Russell the "incomplete symbol" ("the x such that x is   ") in OD is one defining characteristics of transformation. Contextual definition was presented with "incomplete symbol" in OD and OF.

IS THERE A LANGUAGE 'BEHIND' SPEAKING? HOW TO LOOK AT 20TH CENTURY LANGUAGE THEORY IN AN ALTERNATIVE WAY.

Sybille Krämer, Berlin, Germany

There is a standard ‚picture' of how to look at 20th century theory and philosophy of language: Within this picture normally a pragmatic shift is identified from structure oriented (Saussure, Chomsky..) to act oriented concepts of language (Wittgenstein, Austin, Searle, Habermas…). The aim of my talk is to suggest another way of looking at the ‚logical geography' of language theory by investigating the distinction language theorists often make between type/token, schema/use, rule/realization. From this perspective, a new kind of division emerges: On the one hand we can identify proponents of a ‚two worlds model' of language. To this 'cluster' belong structural thinkers such as Saussure and Chomsky as well as the speech act theorists Searle and Habermas. On the other hand, there are those philosophers who take the approach of an 'embodied model' of language, rejecting the division between schema and use. To this category Wittgenstein, as well as Austin, Davidson, Derrida and Butler can be seen to belong. This typology may seem surprising. My talk hopes to make it plausible.

DAS MYSTERIUM DER METAPHER. WITTGENSTEINIANISCHE ÜBERLEGUNGEN ZU BLUMENBERGS METAPHERNTHEORIE

Matthias Kroß, Berlin, Deutschland

Das Geheimnis der Metapher(n) hat sich mittlerweile zu einem Gespenst der Philosophie entwickelt. Trotz zahlreicher Versuche ihrer Hegung durch Theoretisierung entzieht sich die Metapher doch hartnäckig der philosophischen Analyse und Reduktion. Es liegt daher nahe, sie mit Blumenberg als Konstituens nicht nur der menschlichen Sprache zu fassen, sondern zugleich auch das, wofür die Metapher sprachlich steht, als Metapher für das menschliche In-der-Welt-sein selbst zu nehmen. Das

Über-tragen wird auf diese Weise zum Absehen von den Fundierungen des menschlichen Weltbezugs, zu einer sprachlich-konzeptionelle Invention zur strategischen Wirklichkeitsvermeidung. Die Metapher wird damit zu einem nachgerade gespenstischen Wesen, nämlich einem Figur des Widergängers, der kraft seiner Anwesenheit die unheimliche Abwesenheit der Wirklichkeit in ständiger Präsenz hält und auf diese Weise den epochalen phänomenologichen Riss des Weltverhältnisses des Menschen nicht zu heilen vermag.

Demgegenüber eröffnet Wittgensteins Sprachkonzeption die Möglichkeit, die Metapher in ihrer gespenstischen Paradoxalität als konstitutives Moment der menschlichen Selbstverständigung über Welt aufzufassen. Sie ist daher als eine weltstiftende Gabe der Sprache zu betrachten, durch die das Paradox des wirklichkeitsvermeidenden Weltbezugs sich allererst formulieren lässt. Die zu diskutierende These ist, ob in dieser Qualität der Metapher nicht jenes Mystische zu verorten ist, das den jungen Wittgenstein der *Abhandlung* umgetrieben hat und das uns zu der Einsicht verhelfen könnte, dass *Am Anfang die Metapher war.* Aber anders als Blumenberg, der seine Metaphorologie mit Rücksicht auf die Lebenswelt in pragmatisch-anthropologischer Absicht entwickelte, wird das Postulat von der Vorgängigkeit der Metapher beim späten Wittgenstein eben nicht pragmatisch, sondern praxeologisch gestützt und therapeutisch gegen die Theorie gewendet: Das philosophische Studium der Metapher soll nicht allein belehren, sondern auch heilen – sein phantastisches Kalkül besteht darin, zugleich Trost *für*Philosophie und Trost *durch* Philosophie zu spenden – *consolatio philosophiae* eben.

ON THE PRAGMATICS OF UNANSWERABLE QUESTIONS

Peter Kügler, Innsbruck, Austria

Unanswerability claims – statements to the effect that some questions are unanswerable – come in various forms. After a review of some historic and contemporary examples, Wittgenstein´s conception of unanswerability in the Tractatus and the Lecture on Ethics is discussed more deeply. There, the leading theme is similarity (analogy) between natural science and ordinary language on the one side, and metaphysical discourse on the other. To assess unanswerability claims, we need a general account of the logic of questions and answers; we need to know what makes a statement a complete (direct) answer to a question. It turns out that this is mainly a matter of the pragmatics of language. In particular, it depends on psychological and sociological factors, which often have been acknowledged but underrated in erotetic logic. The most important part of context that determines whether a statement is admitted as a possible answer to a question seems to be the paradigm to which questioners and respondents belong. Wittgenstein´s unanswerability claims reflect the naturalistic paradigm he shared with Russell. Whereas Wittgenstein rejected analogies that cannot be replaced by non-analogical statements, metaphysical paradigms typically promote explanations in terms of irreducible analogies. Whereas Wittgenstein located values in the area of the mystical, i.e., of that which cannot be said, teleological paradigms assume them to exist in the world, at the disposal of science. An answer rated as deficient by some philosophers is accepted by members of other traditions. Unanswerability claims contribute to create paradigms; there is no context-independent notion of unanswerability.

18

PRACTICAL NORMS OF LINGUISTIC ENTITIES

Anna Laktionova, Kiev, Ukraine

A philosophical analysis of normativity in constituting linguistic units (LU) leads to the study of ontological and epistemological aspects of realization of linguistic entities in the form of LUs as the facts of speech. An 'internal implicit norm' (practical and epistemic) of LU is a fundamental hypothesis about the possibility of a linguistic entity, makes it possible together with the other norms of it in a pragmatic context, which regulates its appropriateness externally and provides for its interpretation. The formal definition of the practical norm of LU 'p' has the form of the rule of 'evidence': accomplishment of the content of p is 'evident'. For example, practical norm for a statement p, accomplished by A: A knows the content of p. Such norm constitutes p as a type of linguistic entity (statement) and provides criteria for its evaluation (in terms of truth for a statement). In this sense practical norms constitute and regulate LUs.

KEEPING CONCEIVABILITY AND REFERENCE APART

Daniel Lim, Cambridge, United Kingdom

In the debate over phenomenal consciousness and physicalism the so called conceivability argument has taken center stage. David Chalmers has argued that focusing on, what he calls, the primary intension of terms like 'water' and 'pain' allows us to conjoin conceivability and possibility in a way that spells trouble for physicalism. Philosophers like Joseph Levine and David Papineau have responded by saying that conceivability turns on different issues altogether. I believe both parties in the debate are wrong because they fail to keep matters of linguistic reference and conscious conceptualization apart.

MARKS OF MATHEMATICAL CONCEPTS

Montgomery Link, Boston, MA, USA

In Kirchberg am Wechsel in the summer of 1992 Mathieu Marion spoke on the "dark cellar of platonism". Then in 1995 he first published his striking finitist interpretation of the later Wittgenstein, following three years later with a trenchant book on the foundations of mathematics. Marion says that overall the later Wittgenstein is a finitist, thereby posing a challenge to the restrictive traditional interpretation of Wittgenstein's later philosophy of mathematics as being anthropological or strictly finitistic. Yet, a 15 March 1944 manuscript entry on number and rules reveals a case in which Wittgenstein is less finitistic than dialectical, by which I mean that the main point is not so much to secure a particular core account as to describe its possible evanescence.

WITTGENSTEIN, TURING, AND THE 'FINITUDE' OF LANGUAGE

Paul Livingston, New Mexico, USA

I argue that Wittgenstein's rule-following considerations and Turing's 1936 demonstration of the insolubility of Hilbert's decision problem have a common root in thinking about the ability of finite signs to capture infinite procedures or meanings. In the 1939 Lectures on the Foundations of Mathematics, in direct response to Turing, Wittgenstein clearly rejects finitism and suggests that the problem of the meaning of the infinite is to be addressed by considering the finite symbolic "grammar" of infinite procedures and capabilities. This bears similarities to Turing's own application of the "diagonal procedure," which also captures, I argue, the problem of how infinite procedures are represented by finite signs.

"REALITY" AND "CONSTRUCTION" AS EQUIVALENT EVALUATION-FUNCTIONS IN ALGEBRA OF FORMAL AXIOLOGY: A NEW ATTITUDE TO THE CONTROVERSY BETWEEN LOGICISM-FORMALISM AND INTUITIONISM-CONSTRUCTIVISM

Vladimir Lobovikov, Yekaterinburg, Russia

In this paper hitherto missed (neglected) formal-axiological meanings of the words "reality", construction" and "algorithm" are considered as evaluation-functions (in the proper mathematical meaning of the word "function"). These functions are precisely defined by tables and a strict definition of formal-axiological equivalence (among the functions in question) is given as well. Thus quite a new attitude to the formalism of D. Hilbert, the "logicism" of B. Russel and the intuitionism of L.E.J. Brouwer and A. Heyting is submitted. The paper presents a basic (two-valued) variant of discrete mathematical simulation of axiology which investigates the system of values of human activity in general. Algebra of formal axiology is reduced to its particular case – algebra of formal ethics. Then algebra of ethics is used for illuminating the ethical aspect of mathematical activity. This exotic (very unusual) kind of investigating philosophical foundations of mathematics may be called "ethism" (in philosophy of mathematics).

BOLZANO'S THEORY OF LINGUISTIC SIGNS

Winfried Löffler, Innsbruck, Austria

Rarely ever noticed, Bernard Bolzano's (1781-1848) Theory of Science (Wissenschaftslehre, 1837) contains a theory of linguistic and other signs, which "the great-grandfather of analytic philosophy" (M.Dummett) developed in critical reception and rejection of contemporary authors. According to Bolzano, a sign is an object which we use in order to revive/activate by its idea another idea which is connected with it in a thinking being (Wissenschaftslehre, § 285). Bolzano classifies various forms of signs and demarcates signs from mere features ("Kennzeichen"). After a brief survey of Bolzano's treatise on signs and their hermeneutics (§ 387), I will point out three limitations of it: (a) its mentalistic or intentionalistic burden; (b) its presupposition of an implausibly strong atomist or compositionalist view of the meaning of signs where every singular word has a meaning; and (c) a tension in the overall dialectic of his treatise: Bolzano's intentionalistic approach is not easily reconcilable with the need for hermeneutics. Nevertheless, there are some passages where Bolzano seems to notice the weaknesses of his account and comes close to a more adequate treatment.

METAPHOR: PERCEIVING AN INTERNAL RELATION

Jakub Mácha, Brno, Czech Republic

The problem of metaphor has come to a noteworthy revival in the analytical philosophy of today. Despite all progress that has been made, the majority of important studies consider the function of metaphor as an analogue to visual perception. Such comparison may be conceived as metaphor as well. In his late philosophy, Wittgenstein spent a lot of effort to explain the use of the expression "seeing as". I argue that his explanations can be transposed to the explanation of the function of metaphor. Firstly, it is shown that all earlier attempts to do that are not satisfying. The occurrence of the expression "to see as" in everyday language led Wittgenstein to the elaboration of the notion of "aspect". Primarily these ideas should be employed in order to explain metaphors in everyday or even poetic language. My conclusion is that an internal relation can be perceived and thought of in the metaphor.

LANGUAGE AND THE PROBLEM OF DECOLONIZATION OF AFRICAN PHILOSOPHY

Michael O. Maduagwu, Kuru, Nigeria

For a long time, there has been serious debate among African philosophers on whether or not there is "African philosophy". Today, that issue seems to have been settled in affirmative. The debate has now shifted to the question of decolonization of African philosophy. This paper addresses the problem of the place of language in the decolonization enterprise. It concludes that the fact that modern educated Africans must work in foreign languages would not detract from the originality of their thoughts.

LEBENSFORMEN UND LEBENSMUSTER: ZUR DEUTUNG EINES SOGENANNTEN GRUNDBEGRIFFS DER SPÄTPHILOSOPHIE LUDWIG WITTGENSTEINS

Stefan Majetschak, Kassel, Deutschland

Der Begriff der ‚Lebensform' wird von namhaften Interpreten seit je zu den Grundbegriffen von Wittgensteins Spätphilosophie gerechnet. Entsprechend hat er bis heute zahlreiche Deutungen erfahren, die über alle sachliche Differenzen hinweg doch zumeist in der Auffassung übereinstimmen, daß ‚Lebensformen' im Sinne Wittgensteins jene sozialen und kulturellen Systeme bezeichneten, welche die Sprachspiele einer natürlichen Sprache einbetten.

Der Vortrag wird diese Deutung kritisch untersuchen, indem er einige Bemerkungen in den Blick nimmt, in denen Wittgenstein die Einbettung der Sprache in das menschliche Leben tatsächlich diskutiert. Mit der Tatsache, daß Wittgenstein gerade in solchen Zusammenhängen, in denen es naheliegen würde, freilich niemals von ‚Lebensformen' spricht, wird sodann die Vermutung begründet werden, daß er mit diesem Wort etwas ganz anderes gemeint haben könnte. Dazu wird ein Deutungsvorschlag vorgelegt werden.

'VIEWING MY NIGHT': A COMPARISON BETWEEN THE THINKING OF MAX BECKMANN AND LUDWIG WITTGENSTEIN

Dejan Makovec, Klagenfurt, Austria

'It is surely the most foolhardy and unsatisfactory endeavour to wish to express things about art in words or writing; since whether they wish to or not, each person speaks only for their own house, their own soul, and absolute objectivity or justice is impossible.' Thus writes the German painter Max Beckmann. Yet when he expresses himself about his own works, his theories come remarkably close to those of his contemporary Ludwig Wittgenstein. Beckmann's impressions of the First World War were crucial for the further development of his painting, and during the same period Wittgenstein was preparing his first work, the Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus. This appeared at almost the same time as a key work of Beckmann's, Die Nacht ('The Night') – when viewing which one must, according to Beckmann, forget the representational through the metaphysical.

SHOWING AND SELF-PRESENTATION OF EXPERIENCES — A PHILOSOPHICAL CASE

Johann Marek, Graz, Österreich

Intentional experiences — like all experiences (i.e. conscious mental occurrences, "Erlebnisse" in German) — "show themselves", as Wittgenstein put it, or "present themselves", as Alexius Meinong dubbed it.

This kind of showing or self-presentation is not a saying; it does not need the intermediary of a representation of its own. In other words, we are conscious of our experiences without considering them, without observing them. Meinong saw a mark of the mental therein and similarly did Wittgenstein when he tried to characterize psychological verbs ("believe", "see", "pain", "fear", for example). For psychological verbs may express the mental state explicitly without expressing (assertive) information about it.

Philosophical cases like the so-called Moore's paradox ("I don't believe it's raining, but as a matter of fact it is") can be interpreted in the light of the above-mentioned distinction between showing and saying and between self-presentation and "other-presentation", respectively. Moore's paradox is not a paradox of the logic of propositions [Logik des Satzes], it is a paradox of the logic of assertions [Logik der Behauptung], already Wittgenstein said. Logical structure, deducibility, and consistency cannot be reduced solely to propositions. Not only propositions but also assertions, questions, imperatives, wishes and even feelings are accessible to logic. In this sense, the distinction between showing and saying also

helps us to understand how value judgments work according to emotivism. Emotivists claim that value judgments can be interpreted as expressions of a complex of beliefs and — in the final analysis — of (collective) emotions. As there is not only a logic of propositions, the emotivists' claim does not preclude that value judgments can figure in valid arguments.

SIMILITUDO – WITTGENSTEIN AND THE BEAUTY OF CONNECTION

Sandra Markewitz, Bielefeld, Germany

Tracing back Wittgenstein' s awareness of similarities constituting signifying processes of language use (PI 66ff.) to Foucault describing the similitudo category of the Renaissance is fruitful concerning thoughts about the Wittgensteinian way of philosophizing (even if one is not addicted to deconstruction). Especially the practice of connecting the different, even while „teaching differences" (King Lear), can lead to important insights in the field of continuities in the history of the mind. The „Beauty of Connection" consists in the beauty of concepts being applicable to everyday language use by providing information that takes the common way of living seriously without forgetting about the capacity of imagination.

IST DIE INTENTIONALITÄT EINE NOTWENDIGE BEDINGUNG FÜR DIE SATZBEDEUTUNG?

Joelma Marques de Carvalho, München, Deutschland

Nach Wittgenstein wird die Bedeutung eines Wortes in den meisten Fällen durch seinen Gebrauch bestimmt. Außerdem scheint er zu sagen, dass für die Bedeutung unserer Sätze die mentalen Zustände nicht notwendig sind und entwickelt seine Auffassung davon, wie die Sprache funktioniert, ohne jeglichen Rekurs auf das Konzept von Intentionalität. Im Gegensatz dazu spielt Intentionalität eine wichtige Rolle in der Bedeutungstheorie von Searle. Das wichtigste Merkmal, das die Sprache der Intentionalität der mentalen Zustände schuldet, ist die Fähigkeit, etwas anderes zu repräsentieren. Ziel dieser Arbeit ist Nachkonstruktion einer „Debatte" zwischen beiden sowie eine systematische Bewertung ihrer jeweiligen Argumentation.

ELUCIDATION IN TRANSITION OF WITTGENSTEIN'S PHILOSOPHY

Yasushi Maruyama, Higashi-Hiroshima, Japan

'Elucidation' was an important concept for Wittgenstein's early philosophy. It is argued that he carried over some features of Tractarian elucidation in his transition from the early to the later philosophy. His consideration of ostensive teaching as elucidation and Übersicht as an elucidating method is shown to be crucial for the development and consistency of his philosophy.

"FACTS, FACTS, AND FACTS BUT NO ETHICS": A PHILOSOPHICAL REMARK ON DETHRONING

Anat Matar, Tel Aviv, Israel

In this paper I argue that Wittgenstein's writings from the late 20s and the beginning of the 30s reveal some discrepancy between the later Wittgenstein's approach to language and world and his less-revolutionized approach to ethics. Wittgenstein indeed acknowledged the fact that his new views about language and world must have resulted in abandoning his pure and ascetic conception of ethics; yet he did not realize that the linkage forged between meaning and action must yield a blatantly political attitude to matters ethical. This discrepancy sheds light on the fact that Wittgenstein's notion of philosophy remained faithful to some traditional dogma which prohibited him from deducing the most radical consequences from his own revolutionary vision.

MORALS IN THE WORLD-PICTURE

Tobias Matzner, Karlsruhe, Germany

In this paper Wittgenstein's thought on world-pictures in On Certainty is combined with ideas from Hannah Arendt's The Human Condition to get a more refined notion of humans and their relation in the world-picture. This enables the inclusion of moral respectively normative views into the world-picture. My work is informed by Michael Kober's and Andreas Krebs' interpretations of On Certainty as well as Seyla Benhabib's and Dana Villa's discussions of The Human Condition.

IS THE RESOLUTE READING REALLY INCONSISTENT?: TRYING TO GET CLEAR ON HACKER VS. DIAMOND/CONANT

Michael Maurer, Vienna, Austria

The aim of the present paper is to elucidate the metaphilosophical incommensurability between the two current camps in Tractatus research. To this end, I will examine Peter Hacker's claim that the Resolute Reading unconsciously reintroduces through the back-door the previously banished notion of 'important nonsense'. It will be argued that Hacker's conclusion hinges on a misunderstanding of the logical structure of Cora Diamond's mode of speech, thus disregarding the essential role given to the relationship between the logical and the psychological in her account of how the reader climbs the nonsensical rungs of the Tractarian ladder. My contribution is not to opt for either of these exegeses, but to shed light on the heterogeneity of the metaphilosophical strategies they see the early Wittgenstein engaged in on the battle-field of metaphysics.

WAYS OF "CREATING" WORLDS

Ingolf Max, Leipzig, Germany

Many researchers think that Wittgenstein's "Tractarian worlds" and Carnap's "state-descriptions" realizes the same idea. They focus their considerations on the similarities and neglect the important differences which are connected with the different basic interests of these two thinkers. Wittgenstein takes up a holistic position on logic which is connected with his interest to show that there is no tiny piece of ethics within logic. Carnap is mainly interested in a new formal semantics which he needs to reformulate his L-concepts and to give a semantics of modalities like "necessary" and "possible". He takes up a local position on logic. We will show that these differences concern the role of negation and syntactic complexity in "creating" worlds. Subsequently two alternative ways of structuring worlds will be given using a two-dimensional framework. These versions shed new light on the ideas used by Wittgenstein and Carnap.

DIE „TATSACHE" UND DAS „MYSTISCHE" - „WITTGENSTEINISCHE" ANNÄHERUNGEN AN HEIMITO VON DODERERS ROMAN „DIE WASSERFÄLLE VON SLUNJ"

Annelore Mayer, Baden, Österreich

Heimito von Doderer hat in seinen späten Arbeiten versucht, seine Idee eines „Roman muet" zu verwirklichen, in welchem nicht mehr die einzelnen Wörter Träger einer Handlung sind, sondern mittels der Wörter geschaffene Atmosphären zu Trägerinnen der Geschehnisse werden und somit das vom Schriftsteller Intendierte zur Evidenz bringen. Vieles von diesem zur Evidenz Kommenden ist unaussprechlich und kann folgerichtig nicht „zur Sprache" gebracht werden, aber in der vom Autor geschaffenen Atmosphäre des „darüber Schweigens" den Lesenden verständlich gemacht werden. In seinem vorletzten Roman „Die Wasserfälle von Slunj" (1963) finden sich sprachliche Wendungen, welche es angezeigt machen, sie mit durchaus vergleichbaren Formulierungen Wittgensteins in Beziehung zu setzen, wodurch sich eine Möglichkeit ergeben könnte, Doderers Absichten und die von ihm stets geforderte Evidenz gleichsam philosophisch abzusichern.

DIE MUSIK ALS „ANCILLA PHILOSOPHIAE" – ÜBERLEGUNGEN ZU LUDWIG WITTGENSTEIN UND NIKOLAUS CUSANUS

Johannes Leopold Mayer, Baden, Österreich

In der Philosophie Nikolaus' Cusanus und Ludwig Wittgensteins ist Musik immer wieder Mittel der Erkenntnis und verdeutlichender Beschreibung.

In beider Leben hat die Tonkunst eine bedeutsame Rolle gespielt und beide dürfen – unabhängig von ihren ästhetischen Vorstellungen – als musikalisch sehr gebildet, aber auch als sehr empfänglich bezeichnet werden. Zudem sind sie Zeitzeugen enormer Veränderungen im Bereich der Musik. Lassen sich Erkenntnisse über derartige Parallelitäten auch im Hinblick auf die Erkenntnis von Musik und musikalischer Werke nützen? Vielleicht eröffnen sich hier - einerseits über Epochengrenzen hinweg, andererseits aber auch durch die mögliche Parallelsetzung von Epochenphänomenen – Möglichkeiten, durch die Suche nach Ergänzungen in den Denksystemen des Kusaners und Wittgensteins, um damit Phänomenen der Kontinuität in der Musik auf die Spur zu kommen, sie besser zu verstehen und auch besser zu beschreiben.

THE POINTS OF THE PICTURE: HERTZ AND WITTGENSTEIN ON THE PICTURE THEORY

Matthew McCall, Blacksburg, Virginia, USA

It is well documented that during his engineering training, Ludwig Wittgenstein was introduced to and deeply influenced by Heinrich Hertz's writings. What Wittgenstein read as a youth came to later shape the philosophy of the Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus. The Bildtheorie, or picture theory, as described in the Introduction to the Principles of Mechanics is Hertz's most noticeable influence on the early Wittgenstein. In this paper I outline Hertz and Wittgenstein's picture theories and then show that Wittgenstein's is an ontologically richer and stronger version than Hertz's. Moreover, I argue that this must be the case due to Hertz's insistence that two (or more) pictures can correctly picture a state of affairs, whereas Wittgenstein claims that there is only one correct picture for any given state of affairs.

RECOGNIZING THE GROUND AS GROUND: MCDOWELL ON HOW TO READ PHILOSOPHICAL INVESTIGATIONS

Marie McGinn, York, United Kingdom

John McDowell presents a reading of Wittgenstein's remarks on rule-following, which explicitly sets out to absolve Wittgenstein from the charge that he puts forward what McDowell sees as an untenable view, namely, that, when it comes to applying a rule to a new case, what counts as correct is somehow determined by the responses that the members of the relevant speech community are inclined to make. I share all McDowell's dissatisfactions with the communitarian reading, and I am generally sympathetic with his concern to find a reading of Wittgenstein's remarks which avoids committing him to a communitarian account of what constitutes the correct result of applying a rule in a new case. However, I have also been impressed by the objection to McDowell's reading that it simply reinstates a version of the platonism which Wittgenstein's reflections show to be problematic. My main concern in this paper is to identify where I think McDowell's reading goes wrong. I argue that his reading, despite its attractions, misrepresents the nature of Wittgenstein's reflections on rule-following, but that this does not leave the communitarian reading as the only available alternative.

WITTGENSTEIN AND LITERATURE: TRAGEDY AND RESIGNATION – VIVRE SA VIE…

Brian McGuinness, Siena, Italy

Gabriel Garcia Marquez's title Vivir para contarla almost fits Wittgenstein. After a life, extremely mouvementée certainly, but one would have thought sad, he said it had been a wonderful one. This is because it was lived at a high level of interiorization. Every element: war, love, exile, racial persecution, concern for his sins and salvation was wrestled with in search of the perfect – usually the most difficult – solution and this was usually a search for the right spontaneous reaction (a typical Wittgensteinian paradox or "double bind"). And this wrestling was not so much recorded as conducted in his Tagebücher. Reading

of books so entitled – by Tolstoy, Kierkegaard, Dostoevsky and Gottfried Keller – was part of the culture of his family, who tended to model and guide their lives by literature on the margins of religion, such as this. It is perhaps relevant that much of the most intimate part of Wittgenstein's own diaries was written in a simple code understood in his family, as if it were addressed to them like one of the "confessions" (Geständnisse) he sometimes talked about and at least once made. The most confessional volume of his diary passed after his death to his most trusted sister until she confided it to his best friend. Only recently has it come to light.

Keller inspired Wittgenstein with the idea that keeping a diary was the only road to integrity and constancy: a man should always be reflecting on his own character. (We are not far from Socrates' ho anexetastos bios ou biôtos anthrôpôi.) Keller found in his diary occupation for an idle hour – for Wittgenstein it was a necessity. Sometimes he interrupts his philosophical notebooks to exclaim in code on his weaknesses, his vanity, his sins or his aspirations. His real life perhaps was there. But how did his philosophy enter into this and do we need to know this life or "Life" in order to understand or profit from that philosophy? At some times he thought his work was comparatively unimportant. It dealt with one form of the illusions of grandeur or profundity that beset us – but only some of us, the thinkers. Its methods though are the same in essence as those required in the moral sphere. A man has to realize that he is just a man ("Er ist, wie die Menschen sind." was a typically dismissive judgement.) and to be aware of the temptations and idols that mislead him. Again and again in philosophy it is a problem of the will not of the understanding that is attacked. This accounts for the passion that sometimes invested Wittgenstein's criticism of the mathematicians for example. We may compare G.E.Moore's, though a kindly man, going red at the neck in discussion. For these two philosophy was not a game. Truth had to be sought seriously. But that brings us near to another temptation: vanity and the wish to win at all costs. (There was vanity too in the composition of the Tagebücher and the invention of similes – another Wittgensteinian "bind".) I think it is arguable, however, that his method in philosophy was Wittgenstein's nearest approach to the insight he wanted to convey generally, a help to see the world aright. Wittgenstein's own example was that of the "hero" at the end of Wilhelm Busch's Eduards Traum. Only a man of heart can see that he is worth nothing and then everything will turn out right. Das Weitere findet sich, says Wittgenstein too at the end of one of his most fervent Bekenntnisse and perhaps this was the kind of tranquillity he hoped his philosophy would lead to. He frequently quoted Heinrich Hertz's ideal: der nicht mehr gequälte Geist, yet he himself seemed born for Qual, moral, intellectual, or both.

LANGUAGE IN DREAMS: A THREAT TO LINGUISTIC ANTISKEPTICISM

Konstantin Meissner, Berlin, Germany

A prominent modern argument against external world skepticism refers to the linguistic senselessness of skeptical doubt. For example, Wittgenstein writes in On Certainty: 'If you are not certain of any fact, you cannot be certain of the meaning of your words either.' (OC, 114) External world skepticism is thus inconceivable simply because it is based on a linguistic fallacy. But why do we seem to understand skeptical scenarios so easily? From my point of view, the linguistic antiskepticism needs to tie

the meaning of words to the external world. It is because the skeptic cuts off the links to reality that she deprives her hypothesis of meaning. In my presentation I discuss possible amendments for the skeptical position. I focus on the dream argument and investigate the possibility of a language in a dream.

A PRIVILEGED ACCESS TO OTHER MINDS

Guido Melchior, Graz, Austria

It is widely hold view that persons have privileged access to their own minds, although there are numerous different views, how it exactly looks like. One possible interpretation of this privilege of first-person-perspective is to regard reference to own mental states as privileged in comparison to reference to mental states of others.

I will argue for the existence of an additional privilege of third-person-perspective: Other persons can refer to all mental states of a person in way the person herself cannot. Hence, the possibilities for first-person-reference from a third-person-perspective are limited. In this sense, there also exists a privileged access to other minds.

WITTGENSTEIN'S CONCEPTION OF MORAL UNIVERSALITY

Lumberto Mendoza, Quezon City, Philippines

In contemporary ethical theorizing, Wittgenstein is categorized as a particularist (O Neill 1996). Moral claims are reached and advanced not in terms of abstract universal principles but in terms of acquired sensitivities to the requirements of particular situations. Because of this, his position is taken to have the same limitations that come with relativism. These include arbitrariness, self refutation and outright endorsement of evil practices. The paper argues that this reading is mistaken. Though Wittgenstein emphasized flexibility and variability, there are passages in his later work which allow for a notion of moral universality that escapes the limitations of relativism. Wittgenstein's moral position cannot simply be assimilated with existing forms of ethical relativism and moral objectivism.

LANGUAGE AND LOGIC IN WITTGENSTEIN'S TRACTATUS, OR WHY "AN ELEMENTARY PROPOSITION REALLY CONTAINS ALL LOGICAL OPERATIONS IN ITSELF" (TLP 5.47)

Daniele Mezzadri, Stirling, United Kingdom

This paper investigates the relation between Wittgenstein's account of elementary propositions and his account of molecular propositions (and thus the propositions of logic) in the Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus. A very natural reading of that relation holds that the two accounts are separate and distinct from one another; the former rests on the so-called picture theory, whereas the latter is grounded on the principle of truth-functionality. This I call the 'twofold account' reading. After considering why such a reading is mistaken, I concentrate on Wittgenstein's claim that an elementary proposition contains all logical operations in itself (5.47) in order to explain why he can be said to

provide a unified account of elementary and molecular propositions, and, therefore, of language and logic.

PHILOSOPHY AND LANGUAGE

Karel Mom, Amsterdam, Netherlands

This paper comments on Rorty's evaluation of linguistic philosophy and questions his assessment of its current situation. Taking Strawson as an example, Rorty's speculation about the future of philosophy, which he ventures on the basis of this assessment, is relativized. Rorty's evaluation, however, allows for speculations about alternative developments.

A CONTRIBUTION TO THE DEBATE ON THE REFERENCE OF SUBSTANCE TERMS

Luis Fernández Moreno, Madrid, Spain

This paper deals with the reference of a sort of terms which have been in the centre of the debate between the causal and the description theory of reference – for short, descriptivism¯; these terms are the terms for chemical substances, more briefly denominated "substance terms". This paper aims to sketch a version of descriptivism on substance terms which proves to be immune to the main objections from causal theory's advocates, especially from Saul Kripke.

LOGIC DEGREE ZERO: INTENTIONALITY AND (NO[N-]) SENSE IN WITTGENSTEIN'S TRACTATUS

Anna A. Moser, New York, USA

In this paper I argue that language and world are connected in the Tractatus by way of a Projection Method. However this account differs from traditional readings of the Picture Theory , which hold that the projection is the closing of a gap between language and the world. I argue instead that the Projection Method is a linguistic or symbolic maneuver, of which language and world only seem to be the two sides. According to Wittgenstein we project propositions that already have sense onto reality in order to compare the sense of the propositions with reality. I will show that neither the proposition nor reality exists outside and apart from that projection or comparison. Language and world are not divided by a gap in the first place, and propositions are not merely pictures of the world. It is the projection and comparing activity – the use of language itself – by which we have a world.

I therefore claim that the Tractatus is a treatise on intentionality, albeit one that I call Performative Intentionality, since it depends – not on the intentionality of a speaker – but upon that propositions are used the first place. To illustrate the functioning of propositions as projections I discuss the three different kinds or modes of propositions that occur in the Tractatus: propositions with sense, without sense and nonsensical propositions. Because whether propositions have sense, are without sense or are nonsensical depends on their use, I conclude with the thesis that the later Wittgenstein's account of "meaning as use" is already in theory laid out in the Tractatus.

COMING TO LANGUAGE: WITTGENSTEIN'S SOCIAL 'THEORY' OF LANGUAGE ACQUISITION

Danièle Moyal-Sharrock, London, United Kingdom

The two main problems of native language acquisition are: the problem of learning (how to explain our grasp of the meaning of words); and the problem of productivity (how to explain our ability to understand and produce novel, grammatically well-formed sentences when the linguistic corpus we encounter is flawed and limited). Fodor's and Chomsky's solution to both these problems is to posit a (perfect) mental linguistic structure (a universal grammar or a language of thought) as the framework that putatively obviates the need for learning and makes an explanation of productivity possible. Ironically enough, Wittgenstein's solution is not as far removed from Fodor's and Chomsky's as might be supposed. For, Wittgenstein too posits a framework at the basis of our language-games – indeed a partly grammatical framework which includes a universal grammar. But the commonality stops here, for Wittgenstein's universal grammar is neither innate nor inner; it is rooted in our primitive reactions and interactions and is transmitted socio-culturally – either explicitly, through heuristic means; or implicitly, through exposure to, and practice of, the language. Wittgenstein's 'framework' for the acquisition of language is therefore heterogeneous: it consists of a language in use (and hence a grammar); a shared form of life; training and/or repeated exposure. Of course, for a successful acquisition of language, physical susceptibility to such training/exposure, as well as a basic trust on the part of the learner are also required. Wittgenstein's account of how we come to language can be counted as a social theory of language acquisition: it is in social practices, not in the mind, that we come to language.

ZUR FRAGE NACH DEM „VERHÄLTNIS DER TEILE DES URTEILS" – FREGES FUNKTIONALE ANALYSE VON PRÄDIKATEN

Gabriele Mras, Wien, Österreich

Freges Analysen von Prädikaten bestehen in einem viel engerem Verhältnis zu dem, was den ursprünglichen Zweck der Begriffsschrift ausmacht. Dies könnte verständlich machen, warum die Auffassung von Prädikaten als Funktionen nicht dem Zweck einer immanenten Widerlegung von erkenntnistheoretischen Positionen dienen kann.

SENSATIONS, CONCEPTIONS AND PERCEPTIONS: REMARKS ON ASSESSABILITY FOR ACCURACY

Carlos M. Muñoz-Suárez, Cali, Colombia

I shall specify about what we are thinking when we are talking about regulating something by specifying accuracy conditions. The main thesis is that we couldn't describe representational relations as perceptual relationships if we lack a normative conception of relationships between representing and represented. Hence, searching for what it is assessable for accuracy depends on specifying the kind

of intentional content which is normatively individuated and attributed.

DAVIDSON ON DESIRE AND VALUE

Robert H. Myers, Toronto, Canada

Donald Davidson famously held that it is through their triangulations with objects and events in their common environment that the contents of people's beliefs and desires are fixed and that, because of this, each person's beliefs and desires must be by and large correct. But the idea that desires are the sorts of things that could conceivably be correct to evaluative properties of situations or outcomes is one many critics find difficult to understand. My aim in this paper is to explain how Davidson should have responded to their worries.

HOW MAY THE AESTHETIC LANGUAGE OF ARTWORK REPRESENT REALITY?

Dan Nesher, Haifa, Israel

Dealing with how our cognitions represent reality we have to inquire how they can represent it truly. We start from our perceptions in order to continue to other modes of representing reality: scientific, ethical, and aesthetic. These three modes of representations echo Kant's three Critiques, although he did not see them all as modes of representing reality. Therefore we have to turn the tables on his Copernican Revolution to overcome the basic transcendental epistemology. I analyze briefly Wittgenstein's two philosophical systems as prototypes of the Analytic Philosophy of formal semantics and the Phenomenology of interpretation, show their difficulties, and suggest Peircean Pragmaticism as an alternative to deal with how the languages of artworks represent reality aesthetically. Aesthetic representation by allegories differs from Scientific representation by general theories and from the Ethical representation by moral norms guiding our lives. However, only through our confrontation with reality these three cognitive enterprises can represent reality, which cannot be explained by the Analytic Metaphysical Realism or Phenomenological Internal Realism, being severed from reality.

MOORE'S PARADOX AND THE CONTEXT PRINCIPLE

Yrsa Neuman, Åbo, Finland

How come one cannot assert "I believe it is raining and it is not raining" without it becoming absurd in some way, even though it might be true that I believe something which is not the case, and which someone else could perfectly well assert that about me? This problem, called Moore's paradox, depends on a certain view of the proposition, which arguably goes against "the context principle".

SIND DIE TATSACHEN VOM SPRACHSPIEL KONSTITUIERT?: ZU WITTGENSTEINS SPÄTPHILOSOPHIE

Katalin Neumer, Budapest, Ungarn

Wittgenstein wird gewöhnlich ohne weitere Nuancierung unter Philosophen eingestuft, die dafür plädieren, die Tatsachen seien von der jeweiligen Sprache, Kultur oder dem jeweiligen Weltbild etc. konstituiert. Letztere Behauptung kann auch die These nach sich ziehen, daß die Tatsachen an sich – ohne die Sprache, die Kultur bzw. das Weltbild, die sie sozusagen erst konstituieren – nichts seien bzw. keine konstitutive Rolle im Hinblick auf die letzteren hätten. Wittgenstein will in der Tat immer wieder die Bedeutung von Sprache, Kultur bzw. Welbild gegenüber der Fakten selbst hervorheben. In einigen Textstellen stellt er dennoch die Frage, ob und inwieweit die Sprachspiele durch „ein Gerüst von Tatsachen" bedingt sind. Seine Antwort lautet, daß, wenn sich einige Dinge anders verhielten, als sie sich gewöhnlich verhalten, dies dem Sprachspiel seinen Witz nehmen würde, das Spielen des Sprachspiels unmöglich machen würde oder aber ein anderes Sprachspiel zum Resultat hätte. Das legt schon die Schlußfolgerung nahe, daß „die Möglichkeit eines Sprachspiels durch gewisse Tatsachen bedingt ist". Im Vortrag wird erstens der Frage nachgegangen, inwieweit sich diese Behauptungen in die Spätkonzeption überhaupt einfügen und zweitens untersucht, ob es einen Unterschied diesbezüglich zwischen der Konzeption der Philosophischen Untersuchungen und jener der Periode 1946-1951 gibt. Mit der letzteren Untersuchung wird also auch ein Beitrag zum Problem „Third Wittgenstein" geleistet.

ON OVER-INTELLECTUALIZING THE INTELLECT

Alva Noë, Berkeley, CA, USA

In this essay I explore the role that understanding and skill play in shaping perceptual consciousness. Many writers have worried that to acknowledge the role of the understanding in experience is to run the risk of over-intellectualizing experience. I show that this worry arises out of an already over-intellectualized conception of the intellect itself. Kant, especially his work on aesthetic experience, and Wittgenstein, are sources for the position I present. On my view, perception is a skillful and thoughtful activity of exploration of the world around us. The world shows up for perceptual consciousness thanks in good measure to the understanding. The position I develop grows out of my recent book Out of Our Heads: Why You Are not Your Brain and Other Lessons from the Biology of Consciousness (Farrar Straus Giroux, 2009; forthcoming in German from Piper Verlag).

RIGIDITY AND ESSENTIALISM

Joanna Odrowąż-Sypniewska, Warsaw, Poland

According to the semantic conception of rigidity a given kind term is a rigid designator iff it designates the same kind in all possible worlds. According to the metaphysical conception a kind term is a rigid applier iff it is such that if it applies to an object in any possible world, then it applies to that object in every possible world. Both conceptions face serious difficulties. It is widely assumed that natural kind terms should be rigid, while other kind terms should come out as non-rigid. The main problem for the metaphysical conception is that according to the current biological conceptions of species membership in a species is not essential to its members. Hence, biological kind terms are not rigid appliers. In his recent paper Devitt tries to resurrect biological essentialism. I argue that while Devitt's argument is very persuasive, it does not succeed.

CONCATENATION: WITTGENSTEIN'S LOGICAL DESCRIPTION OF THE POSSIBLE WORLD

Jerome Ikechukwu Okonkwo, Owerri, Nigeria

This short paper projects the philosophical concern that every language event performs the role of a framework of a worldhood recollection. Language serves to give a connected and/or concatenated informational structure about the existence, essence, meaning, scope and function of the world as a possibility. To this effect, language is not merely a tool within human possibilities but rather it affords the illustrative openness of the human world. This is to say that where there is language, there is world. With respect to Wittgenstein's philosophical states-of-mind, language significantly points out the predicative-logical-descriptive characters of the possible human world.

ETHICS AND PRIVATE LANGUAGE

Sibel Oktar, Istanbul / Halil Turan, Ankara, Turkey

Wittgenstein's concern in ethics is not to find the answer to 'How ought I to act?' Nevertheless 'conduct' appears to be the major interest in Wittgenstein's conception of ethics. In Tractatus (TLP) he takes conduct to be attitude, whereas in the Philosophical Investigations (PI) he construes it as practice. His picture theory of language in TLP that language provides a picture of reality in correlating words with objects (entities) is replaced with the view of ostensive definition in PI. Wittgenstein allows ostensive definitions to be seen as possible language games among others and avoids the idea that names are correlated to objects. In this presentation we will investigate the presupposition that we need the existence of others to have discourse on ethics through the notion of 'private language'.

MACINTYRE AND MALCOLM ON THE CONTINUITY BETWEEN THE ANIMAL AND THE HUMAN

Tove Österman, Uppsala, Sweden

In this paper will discuss Alasdair MacIntyre's call for a re-evaluation of human rationality. I think what MacIntyre does is interesting as an attempt to point to a misunderstanding of human rationality prevalent in much of philosophy, where human rationality is defined in contrast to the animal and bodily aspects of our existence, and where the judgments we make of animals are seen as necessarily anthropomorphic. However, I will argue that he is not entirely successful in his criticism since he shares the key assumptions underlying the problem he tries to address, and instead of elucidating the animal features of

human rationality the result is an intellectualisation of animal responses to fit them into the (traditional) view of rationality. To this, I will contrast another way of viewing a possible connection between animal and human rationality, Wittgenstein's notion of "primitive reactions" as it appears in Norman Malcolm among others.

THE THOUGHT (GEDANKE): THE EARLY WITTGENSTEIN

Sushobhona Pal, Calcutta, India

This paper will attempt to analyse the Tractarian notion of thought (Gedanke) by particularly focusing on propositions number 3 and 4. The definitions of thought as given in these two propositions, in the Tractarian picture of the relation between language, thought and reality appear to be radically different from each other; one being an ontological interpretation, the other a linguistic one. I will make an attempt to see whether these two definitions are related and if so how. I will also attempt to see whether thinking without speaking is possible from the early Wittgenstenian point of view.

SEARLE ON REPRESENTATION: A RELATION BETWEEN LANGUAGE AND CONSCIOUSNESS

Ranjan K. Panda, Mumbai, India

In this paper, we propose to examine the nature of representation discussed by John Searle. Representation is intentional and is having two aspects: the mental and the linguistic. The naturalists maintain the primacy of mental representation. Searle though advocates that linguistic representation is derived from mental representation, still he differs from the other naturalists like Chomsky and Fodor who uphold that mental representation is syntactical in character and can be causally reducible to the neural processes of the brain. Searle contests this reductionism and argues that the content of representation is semantic, rather than being syntactic. The effort here is to highlight the semantic representation and show how human life is language centric.

LANGUAGE AND WORLD IN WITTGENSTEIN: THE TRUE SOCIAL BONDING

Ratikanta Panda, Mumbai, India

Language and world stand in mutual relation in Wittgenstein. Language was in fact the medium through which Wittgenstein bonded the mind and the world. In this paper, I would discuss the relationship between language and the world as has been envisaged by Wittgenstein in his later thought. By his use theory of the meanings and notions of language games, Wittgenstein embeds language in the world itself, and thus, and brings out a more strong bond between the two. While in the Tractatus, this bonding is purely formal and syntactical, in the Philosophical Investigations, it is more social and semantic. This paper will discuss how this bonding is brought about through the two notions of social nature of meanings and language games.

LANGUAGE AND REALITY: A WITTGENSTEINIAN READING OF BHARTRHARI

Kali Charan Pandey, Gorakhpur, India

This paper is an attempt to deconstruct Bhartrhari's thoughts on language and reality in a Wittgensteinian framework. The issues which have been raised are: (1) One to one relationship between language and reality, (2) Use, context, and language-games, and (3) The Inexpressible and privacy of language. The analysis of the first issue shows that Bhartrhari's thought, in which language can be explained as an enlightened lamp, is almost like picture theory. Next, like Wittgenstein, Bhartrhari also talks about 'usage' and 'context' of an expression as determinant factors of meaning. Finally, it has been shown as to how like the realm of 'showable', Bhartrhari's transcendental reality (Shabdadvaita) is beyond any expression and how Bhartrhari supports Wittgenstein in his rejection of private language even though Wittgenstein denies any role of 'a flash of insight' in determination of meaning of an expression.

WITTGENSTEIN ON THE SELF-IDENTITY OF OBJECTS

Cyrus Panjvani, Edmonton, Canada

According to Wittgenstein, self-identity is not a genuine relation that an object bears to itself. That is, it is not trivially and universally true that an object is identical to itself. This paper will employ the distinction between nonsense and senselessness and explain why, according to Wittgenstein, assertions of self-identity are nonsense. This implies that assertions of self-identity cannot be used to refer to objects qua objects, and this has philosophical consequences for, inter alia, Russell's Axiom of Infinity and Frege's derivation of the natural numbers.

HUSSERL, WITTGENSTEIN, APEL: COMMUNICATIVE EXPECTATIONS AND COMMUNICATIVE REALITY

Andrey Pavlenko, Moscow, Russia

The article's first part Communicative Expectations analyses the main points of the "communicative program" (CP) developed by E.Husserl, L.Wittgenstein and K.-O.Apel, who set serious hopes on "communication" in epistemological justification.

The second part Communicative Reality offers an analytical model, aimed at examination of "validity" of notions and propositions as an inalienable presupposition of communication. With this aim a differentiation between the "factual epistemological validity-I" and the "analytical epistemological validity-II" is made. The first is justified deductively, while the second – inductively. CP is founded on the validity-I. It is shown that an attempt to justify validity in the frames of CP leads to a vicious circle.

WRITING PHILOSOPHY AS POETRY : WITTGENSTEIN'S LITERARY SYNTAX

Marjorie Perloff, Stanford, California, USA

WITTGENSTEIN SOURCE

Alois Pichler / Heinz Wilhelm Krüger / Deidre Smith, Bergen, Norway

In the Summer of 2009, as part of the EU funded DISCOVERY (Digital Semantic Corpora for Virtual Research in Philosophy), 5000 pages of Wittgenstein Nachlass texts will become freely available through the Website Wittgenstein Source. There users will be able to view and search both facsimiles and transcriptions (normalized, diplomatic and other versions) of manuscripts, notebooks, dossiers and typescripts from Wittgenstein's early (1913-14 Notes on Logic complex) and middle period (1929 Lecture on Ethics complex; 1931-34 the Big Typescript complex; 1934-36 the Brown Book complex). Our aim is to present Wittgenstein Source to researchers, the advantages of ist underlying structural and semantic enrichment, as well as, more practically, how it can be used to enhance Wittgenstein scholarship.

AUSSAGE UND BEDEUTUNG. SKIZZE EINER POSTANALYTISCHEN BEDEUTUNGSTHEORIE

Axel Pichler / Michael Raunig, Graz, Österreich

Unsere Ausführungen betreffen die systematisch-konstruktiven Ansätze innerhalb der analytischen Sprachphilosophie des vergangenen Jahrhunderts. Wir möchten eingangs einen zentralen theorieimmanenten Zug erörtern – nämlich die Idee, das Ziel der analytischen Sprachphilosophie bestehe im Auffinden eines allgemeinen Schemas der Bedeutung von sprachlichen Ausdrücken. Aus einigen Forderungen, die vom späten Wittgenstein an Bedeutungstheorien gestellt wurden, wird sodann das Erfordernis abgeleitet, eine weitere Komponente in die Sprachbetrachtung aufzunehmen, die wir anhand von Foucaults Konzept der Aussage festmachen werden; diese Komponente bringt allerdings eine signifikante Transformation des analytisch-semantischen Programms mit sich.

LIFE AND DEATH OF SIGNS AND PICTURES: WITTGENSTEIN ON LIVING PICTURES AND FORMS OF LIFE

Sabine Plaud, Paris, France

A major difference between the early and the later Wittgenstein is commonly assumed to lie in a renouncement to the so-called "picture-theory" of language. Yet, even after the 30's, Wittgenstein maintains a strong connection between propositions and pictures, by asserting that "the picture should be the more direct language". The paper focuses on one given feature held in common both by pictures and linguistic signs, namely their conditions of life. Pictures as well as signs are regarded by Wittgenstein as living organisms, unable to stay alive unless they integrate an organic system: a language, a form of life. The Philosophical Investigations' claim is that "[e]very sign by itself seems dead": in this respect, pictures are very similar to signs, since an isolated picture also loses any kind of vitality or significance.

MAPS VS. ASPECTS: NOTES ON A RADICAL INTERPRETATION

Ákos Polgárdi, Budapest, Hungary

In their paper 'A Perspicuous Presentation of "Perspicuous Presentation"' Phil Hutchinson and Rupert Read express their worry that the fact that, as opposed to Gordon Baker, P.M.S. Hacker has not moved on from an 'elucidatory' reading of Wittgenstein to a purely 'therapeutical' one "reduces the likelihood of people perceiving and practicing Wittgenstein's lasting significance." Their argument for this has two complementary aspects: (1) the negative claim that so-called 'elucidatory' interpretations, by understanding the philosopher's work as analogous to that of the cartographer, fail to do justice to Wittgenstein's real intentions and (2) the positive claim that Baker's interpretation, mainly by endowing aspect-perception with a central methodological role, succeeds where Hacker et al. fail. I argue that (1) rests on a misunderstanding of the function of both maps and perspicuous (re)presentations and that (2) makes too much of the alleged analogy between the method of philosophy and aspect-perception.

MEANING WITHOUT RULES: LANGUAGE AS EXPERIENTIAL IDENTITY

Donald V. Poochigian, Grand Forks, ND, USA

Meaning can occur in a circumstance and not again. Meaning occurring in a circumstance and again is a rule. Language being a rule, meaning can occur without language. Elements occurring sequentially and again are observationally indistinguishable from same elements occurring neither sequentially nor again. Occurring sequentially and again or not constitutes different meaning of same elements, linguistic meaning attributed, not intrinsic. Meaning is the unperceivable abstraction of identity, and language is a set of identities. Linguistic identities can be axiomatic or analogic. Analogic, linguistic rules are defeasible ex post facto generalizations, not indefeasible a priori definitions, contradictions identifying evolutionary pathways.

ACTION, MORALITY AND LANGUAGE

Marek Pyka, Cracow, Poland

In recent metaethics there is an interesting trend to ground moral theory within the sphere of the reasons for action. In the paper I attempt a new analysis of action with particular attention to the situation in which it takes place. I argue that there are some underlying assumptions in the conceptualizations of the situations that affect both the concepts of reasons for action and the whole structure of ethical theories. I illustrate my thesis with the example of J. Dancy's moral particularism and the complex, hybrid theory of T. Nagel.

STRUCTURED LANGUAGE MEANINGS AND STRUCTURED POSSIBLE WORLDS

Jiří Raclavský, Brno, Czech Republic

The present paper sketches the essentials of a proposal which is very Tractarian in its spirit for it exposes some kind of structural isomorphism between (declarative) sentences and (possible) facts (state of affairs). The proposal employs a hyperintensional (procedural) explication of language meanings as suggested by Pavel Tichý. The same logical system is used for explication of facts and possible worlds. Possible worlds are structured, since they contain structured facts.

ON THE EXPLANATORY POWER OF DAVIDSON'S TRIANGULATION

Franz J. Rainer, Innsbruck, Austria

The aim of this paper is to highlight the explanatory power of Davidson's triangulation. In a coherent and easily graspable notion triangulation can answer the following questions: How do thought and conceptual language emerge? There is a relation between the three varieties of knowledge. How can this relation be described in a profound manner? What is the origin of the concepts of objectivity and truth? Can triangulation also provide an interpretation of the concept of rationality? Since all these fundamental questions of epistemology can be answered in a comprehensible way by Davidson's triangulation, one cannot deny the explanatory power of triangulation. This paper will concentrate only on the very important issues because a concise and extensive presentation of the different subject matters would go beyond its scope. However, the explanations should suffice to highlight the explanatory power of Davidson's triangulation.

UND GOTT WAR DAS WORT. – WITTGENSTEINS NIEDRIGE ABSICHTEN

Esther Ramharter, Wien, Österreich

Wittgenstein insistiert auf einer niedrigen Verwendung von Wörtern:

„Während doch die Worte ‚Sprache', ‚Erfahrung', ‚Welt', wenn sie eine Verwendung haben, eine so niedrige Verwendung haben, wie die Worte ‚Tisch', ‚Lampe', ‚Tür'." (PU § 97)

Dieser nivellierenden Wendung scheint jedoch folgende Stelle entgegenzustehen:

„Das Leben kann zum Glauben an Gott erziehen […] – das Leben kann uns diesen Begriff aufzwingen. Er ist dann etwa ähnlich dem Begriff ‚Gegenstand'." (VB, S. 571)

Es würde uns verwundern, wenn hier statt „Gegenstand" etwa „Lampe" stünde (etwas weniger vielleicht „Licht"). Nimmt Wittgenstein also doch eine in irgendeinem Sinn höhere Verwendung eines Begriffs in Anspruch? Man könnte diesem Problem mit dem Hinweis zu entgehen versuchen, dass sich auch das erste Zitat nicht gegen „höhere Wörter", sondern nur gegen „höhere Verwendungen" richtet. Was kennzeichnet aber ein „höheres Wort", wenn nicht die Verwendung?

Der Begriff „Wort", den Wittgenstein in Zusammenhängen wie PU § 97 öfters gebraucht, wäre auch hier, als Alternative zu „Gegenstand", ein naheliegender Kandidat – hat es eine Bedeutung, dass Wittgenstein stattdessen „Gegenstand" wählt?

Der Vortrag wird sich in drei Abschnitte gliedern:

1) Der Kontext der zweiten Stelle (VB, S. 571): Wittgenstein macht diese Bemerkung im Anschluss an eine Überlegung zu Gottesbeweisen

2) Der Kontext der ersten Stelle (PU § 97): Andere Aussagen Wittgensteins erlauben es, zu spezifizieren, was mit einem „niedrigen Gebrauch" gemeint ist

3) Die eine Ebene, die angemessene Kategorie und der gehandhabte Nimbus: Zusammenfassend versuche ich eine Antwort auf die eingangs gestellten Fragen zu geben.

WITTGENSTEIN VS. RAWLS

Rupert Read, Norwich, United Kingdom

OBJECTIVE INTERPRETATION AND THE METAPHYSICS OF MEANING

Maria E. Reicher, Aachen, Germany

In some sense, everything can be interpreted, but some things virtually seem to call on us to interpret them, notably those things that are products of intentional human actions, i.e., artifacts. This holds in particular for sequences of linguistic signs, i.e., texts.

In this paper, three closely interrelated questions concerning the interpretation of texts shall be explored:

1. What does it mean to interpret a text in the first place?

2. Can interpretations be right or wrong? In other words, can interpretive claims be true or false?

3. Is there such a thing as an objective meaning of texts (i.e., a meaning that exists independently of interpretations)?

There is not one single activity that is called "interpretation" but various distinct ones. All of them are in some way or another related to what one may call the "meaning" of the text. However, the concept of (textual) meaning is ambiguous too.

It shall be argued that there is at least one kind of interpretation which indeed can be right or wrong. Consequently, there are interpretive claims that are true or false. These are interpretations that aim at a description of the objective meaning of a text. An interpretation of this sort is right if it corresponds to the text's objective meaning, and it is wrong if it fails to do so.

This objectivist position shall be defended against some popular objections, and the notion of an objective meaning shall be clarified.

VOM BILDSPIEL ZUM SPRACHSPIEL – WIEVIEL KOMPOSITPHOTOGRAPHIE STECKT IN DER LOGIK DER FAMILIENÄHNLICHKEIT?

Ulrich Richtmeyer, Potsdam, Deutschland

Im folgenden Beitrag soll gezeigt werden, dass Wittgensteins Begriff der Familienähnlichkeit direkt der Bildlogik von Galtons Kompositphotographie folgt. Er wiederholt demnach die bildlogische Struktur, nach der Einzelexemplare unter einer Verallgemeinerungsabsicht in der Kompositphotographie arrangiert werden. Eine Analyse des Kompositbildes demonstriert entsprechend, dass und wie sich in ihm zwei kategorial verschiedene Bild-Merkmale überlagern. Daraus ergibt sich ein Modell jener spezifischen Simultanität von Unterschieden und Gemeinsamkeiten, die Wittgenstein dann zwischen den Objekten der Familienähnlichkeit thematisiert. Auch das von Frege und Russel tradierte Thema einer spezifischen Vagheit verschwommener Grenzen hat Wittgenstein anhand der optischen Überlagerungen im Kompositbild präzisiert und in den von Galton statistisch marginalisierten Bildrändern ein methodisch wertvolles „Netz von Ähnlichkeiten" konstatiert.

Wird die bildlogische Analyse der Kompositphotographie so zum Ausgangspunkt einer Neuinterpretation des Begriffs der Familienähnlichkeit, müssen auch alle vier Standardmerkmale des Begriffs entsprechend korrigiert werden.

ZUR BESCHREIBUNG DER FUNKTION VON WAHRHEITSBEDINGUNGEN

Stefan Riegelnik, Wien, Österreich

Obwohl die Verbindung zwischen Wahrheit und Bedeutung und die These, wonach man einen Satz versteht, wenn man seine Wahrheitsbedingungen kennt, kaum bestritten wird, sind gerade in letzter Zeit eine Reihe von Auffassungen vertreten worden, die von dem ursprünglichen Sinn dieser Bestimmung abweichen. Dass diese Abweichung ihre Funktion nicht erfüllen kann, Semantik und Erkenntnistheorie zu verbinden, sondern letztlich semantische und erkenntnistheoretische Überlegungen in Konflikt zueinander bringt, soll hier gezeigt werden.

WITTGENSTEIN'S PHILOSOPHICAL METHODS IN ON CERTAINTY

Brian Rogers, Irvine, California, USA

On Certainty has recently been characterized as marking a shift from the therapeutic tendencies of the Philosophical Investigations to a more systematic philosophical approach. While Wittgenstein sometimes engages in theoretical tasks in the earlier sections of On Certainty, I argue that he abandons this approach for a return to his familiar therapeutic and deflationary methods in the second half of the book. Wittgenstein praised his final efforts in On Certainty but repeatedly criticized his work found in the earlier sections. These shifts in methodology and self-critique are shown to correlate with changes in the cancer treatments that Wittgenstein received.

LUDWIG WITTGENSTEIN ÜBER WILHELM BUSCH: „HE HAS THE REAL PHILOSOPHICAL URGE"

Josef G. F. Rothhaupt, Munich, Germany

Das Werk des Malers, Zeichners und Dichters Wilhelm Busch (1832-1908) hatte auf Ludwig Wittgenstein (1889-1951) zeitlebens einen erheblichen und nachhaltigen Einfluss. Mit dem Vortrag wird das Augenmerk der Wittgensteinforschung eben auf dieses Faktum gelenkt. Dabei kommt die „Wahlverwandtschaft" zwischen Busch und Wittgenstein deutlich zum Vorschein. Und es zeigt sich, was Wittgenstein meint, wenn er am Ende seines Lebens in einem Brief an seinen Schüler und Freund Rush Rhees ausdrücklich lobend vermerkt, dass Wilhelm Busch den echten philosophischen Impetus besitze. So kann das Studium der Werke von Busch einen innovativen Zugang zur Philosophie Wittgensteins eröffnen. Und gegenläufig kann sich von Wittgensteinschen Auffassungen her auch ein neuer Blickwinkel auf Busch als Philosophen ergeben.

In einem ersten Schritt sind die, in den vergangenen zwei Jahrzehnten recherchierten und gesammelten, Belege für diese „Wahlverwandtschaft" beizubringen. Unabdingbare Voraussetzung hierfür sind einerseits umfassende Kenntnisse über den Wittgensteinschen Gesamtnachlass und andererseits Studien des Gesamtwerkes von Wilhelm Busch. So lassen sich für viele Schriften, Bildergeschichten und Zeichnungen von Busch explizite Zitate, Abbildungen, Referenzen, Hinweise und Anspielungen bei Wittgenstein in verschiedenster Weise angeben. Neben der Auswertung des philosophischen Nachlasses von Wittgenstein müssen weitere Untersuchungen vorgenommen und zusätzliche Dokumente präsentiert werden. Beispielsweise die Auswertung von Wittgensteins Briefwechsel mit Schülern, Freunden und Verwandten, das Einholen authentischer Zeitzeugenberichte und die Recherche bisher unbekannt gebliebener biographischer Dokumente.

In einem zweiten Schritt sind diese Belege in den Kontext Wittgensteinscher Philosophie einzuordnen und als Elemente Wittgensteinschen Philosophierens zu interpretieren. Dabei zeigt sich nicht nur, dass Wittgenstein Werke von Busch – die Prosaschriften „Eduards Traum" und „Der Schmetterling", die Bildergeschichten z.B. „Maler Klecksel" und „Anleitung zu historischen Porträts", die Märchensammlung „Ut Ôler Welt", den Briefwechsel „Wilhelm Busch an Maria Anderson", die Nachlassgabe „Hernach" und viele Zeichnungen und Karikaturen sehr gut kannte, hoch schätzte, oft zitierte und markant in sein schriftstellerisch-philosophisches Gesamtwerk integrierte, sondern es wird auch deutlich, dass der Einfluss von Wilhelm Buschs Lebenswerk und Lebensform bis ins Zentrum der Arbeit des Philosophen Ludwig Wittgenstein hineinreicht. So kommen Themen wie „Philosophie und Literatur", „Philosophie und Witz", „Philosophie und philosophischer Impetus" in der Wittgensteinforschung ins Blickfeld.

RELIGIÖSE SPRECHAKTE UND INTENTIONALER GEGENSTAND

Edmund Runggaldier, Berlin, Deutschland

Ich möchte auf Aspekte der Sprechakte aufmerksam machen, die vorschnelle Verallgemeinerungen von Thesen zur Funktionalität der religiösen Rede vereiteln. Ein solcher Aspekt ist z.B. die Absicht des jeweiligen Sprechers: Will man eine adäquate Rekonstruktion der Bedeutung der religiösen Sprechakte, kann man nicht umhin, auch den von den Sprechern intendierten Bezug auf das jeweilige intentionale Objekt mit zu berücksichtigen, unabhängig davon, ob man glaubt, dass es real oder fiktiv ist. Tut man das, kann man nicht mehr annehmen, die religiöse Rede von Gott sei durch andere Redensarten schon allein wegen einer Entsprechung oder einer besseren Erfüllung bestimmter Funktionen ersetzbar.

CUBES, CLOUDS & READING THE PHILOSOPHICAL INVESTIGATIONS

Rebekah Rutkoff, New York, NY, USA

The Philosophical Investigations is filled with gestures of pulling-apart: word from meaning, meaning from object, object from identity, picture from use. From the very start, the sustainability of the scenario in which every word has a meaning--the object for which the word stands--is surely in great trouble, as Wittgenstein threatens to snip the flimsy cord tying the object to its apparent companions. In response to both the fantasy of separation and the actuality of its impossibility, I will investigate the Philosophical Investigations by means of two words, two concepts, two forms, two pictures which exist in a kind of mingled and chiastic relationship to one and other: cube and cloud. I will inspect both their explicit presence in the text (Wittgenstein has much to say about clouds and cubes) and their implicit presence as looser rhetorical forms that are connected to the hardness and vagueness of logic, certainty and thought itself.

HISTORY AND OBJECTS: ANTONIO GRAMSCI AND SOCIAL ONTOLOGY

Alessandro Salice, Graz, Austria

Social ontology is a new approach in treating old problems: In my paper I will expose the ontology of the Italian philosopher and politician Antonio Gramsci, who at the beginning of the last century developed a sophisticated theory concerning social objects within a Marxist framework. Gramsci's intuition is that not all objects are material: social objects are not. The reality of these objects depends on the beliefs of social groups and their constitution depends on the functions social objects have to fulfil for the groups in question. Since the existence of social groups develops through history, social objects too are historical, i.e. they exist only within a human (i.e. a social or historical) dimension.

PEIRCE ON COLOUR (WITH REFERENCE TO WITTGENSTEIN)

Barbara Saunders, Leuven, Belgium

While Peirce and Wittgenstein are not directly linked in their discussions of 'colour,' this paper nevertheless suggests connections between them.

SIND SINNESEINDRÜCKE INFORMATIONSTRÄGER? (EINE LEKTION AUS „PHILOSOPHISCHE UNTERSUCHUNGEN" 355 UND KONTEXT.)

Eike von Savigny, Bielefeld, Deutschland

In PU 352 ff. hat Wittgenstein es damit zu tun, „daß uns unser Denken einen seltsamen Streich spielt", nämlich daß wir den Satz vom ausgeschlossenen Dritten zitieren, um sagen zu können: Wenn wir uns gegen einen Satz wehren, ist seine Negation wahr, also sinnvoll. Damit können wir einen „grammatischen Satz" übersehen, so wie i. F. den Satz, „daß [unsere] Sinneseindrücke uns täuschen können" (PU 354). Der heißt weiter nichts als: Wenn jemand (auf Grund des Gebrauchs seiner Sinnesorgane) irrig annimmt, es regne, „hat er den täuschenden Eindruck, es regne", weshalb „die Tatsache, daß [die Eindrücke] uns gerade den Regen vortäuschen, auf einer Definition beruht" (PU 354). Die oben erwähnte Versuchung führt von hier zu der höchst substantiellen philosophischen Einsicht, daß gerade nicht-täuschende Sinneseindrücke uns „die Kunde davon, daß es regnet" bringen (PU 356). Daß man etwas glaubt, wird damit so gedreht, als stünde man einer informativen Entität (einer „mentalen Repräsentation") gegenüber. Es läßt sich zeigen, daß Wittgenstein diesen Fehler auch in einer Reihe anderer Zusammenhänge bloßlegt, wo durch Umformulierungen Substantive in die Sprache für das Seelenleben eingeführt werden – Substantive, die mentale Objekte im mentalen Gegenüber von „spüren", „empfinden" oder einfach „haben" bezeichnen sollen.

ARE MENTAL REPRESENTATIONS INFORMATION MEDIA? (A LESSON FROM PHILOSOPHICAL INVESTIGATIONS § 355 AND ENVIRONS.)

Eike von Savigny, Bielefeld, Deutschland

In P. I. 352 ff., Wittgenstein mentions the case "that our thinking plays us a queer trick", viz. that we quote the law of excluded middle in order to argue: if we reject a sentence, then its negation is true and has therefore got a sense. We may, however, be overlooking a "grammatical sentence" like "[our] sense-impressions can deceive us" (P. I. 354). This sentence just means: if someone, on account of using his sense-organs, erroneously believes that it is raining, "he has the deceptive impression that it is raining"; this is why "the fact that the false appearance is precisely one of rain is founded on a definition" (P. I. 354). The temptation mentioned above will then result in the very important philosophical insight that it is precisely non-deceptive sense-impressions that convey true "information that it is raining" (P. I. 356). In this way, believing something is masqueraded as being confronted with informative entities ("mental representations"). It can be shown that Wittgenstein exposes this mistake in several contexts where nouns are introduced into the language of

the mental, nouns designed to designate mental objects of mental confrontations like "sense" or "entertain" or simply "have".

WITTGENSTEIN AND SEBALD: "HOME" AND THE GRAMMAR OF MEMORY

David Schalkwyk, Cape Town, South Africa

Wittgenstein appears in W.G. Sebald's work in a variety of forms, both explicit and implicit. My paper traces the place of the Austrian philosopher in the German novelist's fiction by examining the common role of the concept of the loss or search for home in each via the grammar of memory. Sebald invokes Wittgenstein explicitly in his novel Austerlitz, and the tales that make up The Emigrants and Vertigo. But there are also more implicit, suggestive modes of interaction between them. I argue that if Wittgenstein thought of himself as the inventor of similes, Sebald, as it were, returns his philosophical similes to their place or home in the world, giving them a literal historicity that is paradoxically also fictional. Sebald calls upon Wittgenstein's idea of returning language to its "home" by examining the devastating effects of the mid-European, and especially Jewish, withdrawal of home and the devastation of memory which Wittgenstein's philosophical work passes over in silence. The evocation of the biographical figure of Wittgenstein in Sebald's attempts to come to terms with loss and denial following the Holocaust in characters like Jacques Austerlitz, Paul Bereyter, Max Ferber, and the narrator himself, suggests that an ethics of memory consonant with the demands of human suffering from the Belgian Congo to Theriesenstadt lies in following Wittgenstein's disavowal of causal explanation for the never-ending quest for "seeing conncetions".

A RESOLUTE LATER WITTGENSTEIN?

Genia Schönbaumsfeld, Southampton, United Kingdom

'Resolute readings' initially started life as a radical new approach to Wittgenstein's early philosophy, but are now starting to take root as a way of interpreting the later writings as well – a trend exemplified by Stephen Mulhall's latest book (2007), *Wittgenstein's Private Language*, as well as by some recent work published in *Metaphilosophy* (Hutchinson 2007; Harré 2008). In this paper I will show that there are neither good philosophical nor compelling exegetical grounds for accepting a resolute reading of the later Wittgenstein's work. It is possible to make sense of Wittgenstein's philosophical method without either ascribing to him an incoherent conception of 'substantial nonsense' or espousing the resolute readers' preferred option of nonsense austerity. If my interpretation is correct, it allows us to recognize Wittgenstein's radical break with the philosophical tradition without having to characterize his achievements in purely therapeutic fashion.

THE HARMONY OF THOUGHT AND REALITY

Joachim Schulte, Zürich, Switzerland

§§428-65 of Philosophical Investigations (PI) deal with questions that suggest themselves when one tries to understand the idea of 'harmony between thought and reality' (§429). If we follow various commentators in regarding this part of the book as a 'chapter' dealing with aspects of the notion of harmony, or agreement, between thought and reality, we shall soon run up against a number of difficulties of interpretation. Many of these difficulties, I want to claim, are due to the fact that this part of the book is in a sense the earliest: nearly all its remarks go back to manuscripts written in the early 1930ies. But when, around 1945, Wittgenstein tried to put together the last version of PI he reassembled these remarks to form the familiar chapter on harmony. The main question I want to discuss in this paper is whether Wittgenstein's attempt to join together old remarks to form a new chapter can be regarded as a success. Of course, to answer this question we need to have an idea of what to count as a 'success', and this in turn involves many exegetical questions. So, in a way what looks like a fairly external question about the origin of this part of PI is bound to lead to substantial questions of interpretation and can ultimately be seen to raise the recurrent issue of the unity of the Investigations.

MANY-VALUED APPROACH TO ILLOCUTIONARY LOGIC

Andrew Schumann, Minsk, Belarus

The first formalization of illocutionary logic was created by J.R. Searle and D. Vanderveken. In our paper we proposed a modal calculus in that illocutionary forces and performances are considered as logical operations of a special kind. As a result, we constructed an easier formalization of illocutionary acts than usual ones. We developed also some applications of this logic to model-theoretic semantics of natural language and to natural language programming.

EXTERNAL REFERENCE AND RESIDUAL MAGIC

Paul Schweizer, Edinburgh, United Kingdom

Putnam famously criticizes the traditional theory of meaning and reference, and argues that no internal configuration of a cognitive system is able to capture the intended objects of linguistic reference. Indeed, a 'magical connection' between language and world would be required for the traditional theory to work. Putnam attempts to replace the magical dependencies assumed by the traditional theory with an externalist account based on causal chains and direct access to the world. However, I argue that he does not carry the exorcism far enough, and that his own theory assumes a literal and substantive interpretation of reference which itself must be relinquished if his critique of the traditional view is carried to its natural conclusion.

THE LINGUISTIC OPTIMISM: ON METAPHYSICAL ROOTS OF LOGIC IN WITTGENSTEIN'S TRACTATUS

Marcos Silva, Rio de Janeiro, Brazil

In opposition to the positivist interpretation, represented paradigmatically by Vienna Circle philosophers, I defend

that philosophy of logic from Wittgenstein's Tractatus Logico-philosophicus has strong realistic and metaphysical roots. However, his realism in logic is different from Frege's and Russell's realist account of logic. It demands, as a precondition, the assumption of an essential isomorphism between world and language. As a result, I hold this tractatian principle of "all-embracing world through language" as a peculiar kind of linguistic optimism. The main objective of this paper is to give a contribution to the current debate on philosophy by showing that the status of logic in Tractatus requires _ optimismcally _ that language can fully cover the world. Its secondary aim is to ground the statement that the tractatian philosophy of logic is metaphysical and, even more, it is realist.

WITTGENSTEIN, SCEPTICISM AND CONTEXTUALISM

Rui Silva, Azores, Portugal

The paper analyses Wittgenstein's response to scepticism in the light of the contextualist ideas contained in his later work. Special emphasis is given to his analysis of doubt and to the distinction between knowledge and certainty. Another major concern of the paper is to evaluate the significance of Wittgenstein's thought for the contemporary debate on scepticism and contextualism. On the one hand, two principles involved in current sceptical arguments, the closure principle and the underdetermination principle, are examined from a Wittgensteinian perspective. On the other hand, Wittgenstein's contextualism is compared with contemporary forms of contextualism.

SOCIAL CONSTRUCTION OF SCIENTIFIC KNOWLEDGE: REVISITING SEARLEAN NOTION OF BRUTE AND INSTITUTIONAL FACTS

Vikram Singh Sirola, Mumbai, India

The paper delves into Searle's conception of brute and institutional facts when appropriated to the nature of scientific knowledge. Scientific enterprise depends on institutional facts where its goal is guided by the collective sensitivity concerning the 'truth'. We contend that, this goal is attainable only by establishing epistemic access to the brute facts of the external reality. Mere experiential access to the brute facts through human intentionality, as Searle believes, does not beget knowledge. Knowledge, particularly scientific, emerges when the reality is reached through theoretical construction. Scientific knowledge is construed as entrenched in institutional life.

WITTGENSTEIN VERSUS HILBERT

Hartley Slater, Crawley, Australia

A crucial link between language and the world was identified by Wittgenstein, when he discussed the extra-linguistic paradigms around which our understanding of concepts must centre. The place of such paradigms has been forgotten in the twentieth century tradition of Meta-mathematics. Remembering their place enables two very basic criticisms to be made of this tradition: it obscured the Kantian, i.e. synthetic nature of the rest of Mathematics,

but also it obscured the fact that it itself was equally synthetic.

THE EPISTEMOLOGY OF UNSURVEYABLE TOTALITIES

Hans Sluga, Berkeley, California, USA

THE WORLD AS STATES OF AFFAIRS IN WITTGENSTEIN AND ARMSTRONG

Alexandr Sobancev, Yekaterinburg, Russia

In this article it is investigating the question of a structure of the world that requires more attention to be given. A model of the Tractatus is a logical structuring of the world that is considered as a conjunction of states of affairs. This attitude leads to ordering things into clusters that function as a system. According to Wittgenstein a description of the world in language is possible. The relations between states of affairs are problematized. The theory was presented in further doctrines, in Armstrong's factualism for instance. The later is related to ontological construction of the world. A question of investigating of the world consists in inquiring of states of affairs as truthmakers and relations between facts. It is considered a double-sided model of the world based on two standpoints in question.

VERSCHLÜSSELUNG IN WITTGENSTEINS NACHLASS

Ilse Somavilla, Innsbruck, Österreich

Im Nachlass von Ludwig Wittgestein finden sich an die 450 Stellen, die in verschlüsselter Schrift abgefasst sind und in der Rezeption weitverbreitet als „Geheimschrift-Stellen" bezeichnet werden. Diese teils tagebuchartigen, häufig in Form von Aphorismen oder Fragmenten in den Manuskripten verstreut auftretenden Aufzeichnungen, heben sich von dem in Normalschrift gehaltenen, philosophisch geführten Diskurs ab; sie ragen aus diesem als etwas Eigenständiges heraus, das mit dem philosophischen Inhalt in keinem unmittelbaren Zusammenhang zu stehen scheint.

In ihrer geschlossensten Form finden sich verschlüsselte Eintragungen in den Tagebüchern 1914-1916, wo sie sich auf der linken Seite der Manuskripte befinden und als Wittgensteins persönliche Tagebücher zu betrachten sind.

Während die in Normalschrift gehaltenen philosophischen Aufzeichnungen bereits 1960 ediert sind, blieb der verschlüsselte Teil der Tagebücher der Öffentlichkeit über Jahrzehnte hinweg nicht zugänglich. Obwohl seit 1990 nun einzelne Publikationen codierter Aufzeichnungen vorliegen, so wurden diese in ihrer Gesamtheit bis dato weder ediert, noch auf die Hintergründe untersucht, die Wittgenstein bewogen haben könnten, einen Code zu benützen. Ebenso wenig ist ihr Stellenwert innerhalb seines philosophischen Werks erforscht. Häufig werden sie als persönliche Eintragungen Wittgensteins gewertet, oder als kulturphilosophische Bemerkungen, insbesondere im Hinblick auf ethische und religiöse Fragen. Dies trifft jedoch keineswegs auf alle verschlüsselten Stellen zu.

Anliegen meines Vortrags ist es, anhand von Beispielen an verschlüsselten Aufzeichnungen im Nachlass Wittgensteins dem Bezug zum philosophischen Werk sowie der Frage nachzugehen, weshalb er für bestimmte Bemerkungen einen Code verwendete. Ob er damit eine bestimmte Absicht verfolgte, um u.a. das, worüber er nicht schreiben wollte, auf „verhüllte" Weise darzustellen? Ob diese Bemerkungen vielleicht auch als Beispiel für seine Sprachphilosophie angesehen werden können – insofern er mit ihnen eine bestimmte Funktion von Sprache erfüllt sah, die durch wissenschaftliche Dispute nicht erreicht werden kann? – Als eine besondere Art, Sich-Zeigendes von klar Sagbarem zu trennen? Etwa in Form von einer Art poetischer Sätze als Gegenpol zu streng philosophischen Argumentationen?

Denn nicht nur die Schrift unterscheidet sich von der Normalschrift, auch Inhalt und Form weichen von dem in Normalschrift gehaltenen ab, so dass die Vermutung nahe liegt, Wittgenstein wollte mit dem Code einen bestimmten Texttypus, einen bestimmten Stil, markieren.

HOW TO ARTICULATE MUSIC «SUB SPECIE AETERNI» WITH UNDERSTANDING MUSIC IN CONTEXT? (READING WITTGENSTEIN EXTERNALLY)

Antonia Soulez, Paris, France

Wittgenstein's remark (Zettel, §173) that a whole world is contained in a small musical phrase, stresses a kind of understanding conveyed through physionomic features, facial aspects, tone, intonation, mimics and so forth, rather than focused on a content to grasp.

I will scrutinize the type of understanding we are here dealing with. Given the fact that Wittgenstein's view reveals itself as a cultural expression of a conception dominated with the paradigme of autonomous music in Hanslick's sense, one can easily aknowledge that Wittgenstein's own remark makes his conception of music an expression of the more classical model of romantic music while at the same time, music was becoming « modern » under the impulse of Schoenberg the director of the Vienna school. This argument is often mentioned as an historical detail of Wittgenstein's biography that is to be just admitted, though paradoxical.

Not only does this paradox show the partiality of Wittgenstein's notion of context, but it induces a rather complicated view of what it is for a musical work and its understanding to be expressively related to culture. In Wittgenstein's case, it also suggests that Wittgenstein in some way or another sticked to a melodic tonal model that was in his times being overthrown. Yet, Wittgenstein's criteria of understanding music « coherence » - Zusammenhang - and « comprehensibility » - Fasslichkeit – that still match Schoenberg's ones, yet through different aesthetic glasses, will hold true until the model of the phrase as a unit of sense breaks out. This break out appears after Schoenberg, as is shown by Berg's rebellion against the dodecaphonic « solfège ». As Boulez declared in 1952 : « Schoenberg est mort ». Since then, through different stages, and to-day with sound-composing music under the threshold of the notal-entity, the « phrase-model » has ceased to prevail in composing music. Reading Wittgenstein from this external point of view therefore shows that the (changing) context falsifies his own saying (§ 173 above).

The decline of the paradigma of a musical sentence as unit of sense also means the decline of understanding music as a « system of coherences » comparable to a language, a decline Adorno deplored as well as Dahlhaus, who both criticized Cage and others because they compose with sounds as mere informal and indeterminate processes. This diagnosis indeed witnessed a nostalgia for the criteria of music understanding relying on a (partial or not) analogy of music with language.

Hence, two problems : 1- the possibility of mentioning family ressemblances between Wittgenstein's language-games and Cage's sound-games, does not cope with Wittgenstein's attachment to the melodic-tonal system of music. 2- My question will thus be, in parallel with the question about ethics raised by Anat Matar in this symposium : how to conciliate the status of « sub specie aeterni » music in Wittgenstein's later philosophy with a pragmatic conception of contextual understanding ?

GENERISCHES WISSEN IN EINER KATEGORIALEN INFERENZSTRUKTUR: ZUR METAPHYSIK DES BEGRIFFLICHEN

Pirmin Stekeler-Weithofer, Leipzig, Deutschland

Außerhalb bloßer (mathematischer) Formalsprachen bestimmen materialbegriffliche Inferenzformen den Inhalt unserer Wörter und Sätze. Diese materialbegrifflichen Schlüsse sind durch einen Kanon kategorial vorsortierten Wissens als nomalerweise verlässlich bestimmt. Die Entwicklung eines derartigen generischen Wissens und des inhaltlich Sagbaren fallen daher weitgehend zusammen. Deswegen zählen nicht bloß die prädikatenlogischen Definitionen komplexer Prädikate in sortalen Gegenstands¬bereichen oder andere rein verbalterminologische Regelungen zu den ‚trans¬zen¬dentalen' Bedingungen empirischer Ge¬halte, sondern ganze Systeme von allge¬meinen Vor-Beurteilungen. Diese gehen als eine Art Metaphysik des Begriffs den empiri¬schen Einzelurteilen in gewissem Sinn a priori voran. Sie sind auch nicht durch Ein¬zel¬beobachtungen oder auch statistische Häufigkeiten korrigierbar, sondern be¬währen sich in gemeinsamen Orien¬tierungen auf allgemeine Weise.

WITTGENSTEIN ON THE INVERTED SPECTRUM

David Stern, Iowa City, Iowa, USA

The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy entry on "Inverted Qualia" begins by noting that "Qualia inversion thought experiments are ubiquitous in contemporary philosophy of mind (largely due to the influence of Shoemaker 1982 and Block 1990). The most popular kind is one or another variant of Locke's hypothetical case of "spectrum inversion", in which strawberries and ripe tomatoes produce visual experiences of the sort that are actually produced by grass and cucumbers, grass and cucumbers produce experiences of the sort that are actually produced by strawberries and ripe tomatoes, and so on." This paper reviews and evaluates what Wittgenstein had to say on the topic.
    In the *Philosophical Investigations*, Wittgenstein observes that the idea of private experience, "that nobody knows whether other people also have *this* or something else" (sec 272) supports the assumption that it is possible,

but unverifiable, that "one part of mankind had one sensation of red, and one part another", and thus the possibility of spectrum inversion. However, he does not explicitly discuss such hypotheses. Recently, Block (2007) has drawn attention to Wittgenstein's discussion of spectrum inversion in the "Notes for Lectures on 'Sense Data.'" There, Wittgenstein discusses "cases in which we should say that the person sees green what I see red" (Wittgenstein 1993, 285), conceding that a single person case of spectrum inversion is conceivable, but denying that this could always be the case. Block argues that a slippery slope leads from the concession of the possibility of spectrum inversion in a particular case to a scenario in which many people experience long-term spectrum inversion, and that such scenarios are verifiable hypotheses. I evaluate Block's critique of Wittgenstein, and Canfield's (2009) response to Block's reading.

DIE KRITIK DER METAPHYSIK IM WERK L. WITTGENSTEINS „PHILOSOPHISCHE UNTERSUCHUNGEN"

Paul Antolievich Stolbovskiy, Barnaul, Russland

Im Artikel wird die Frage betrachtet: wäre es möglich, als Kritik jenes Mittel des Umdenkungsprozesses des „metaphysischen Denkens" zu bezeichnen, das unzweifelhaft von L. Wittgenstein in seinem Werk „Philosophische Untersuchungen" verwirklicht wird.

ZUR PERFORMATIVITÄT DES NARRATIVEN: ANSÄTZE EINER PERFORMATIVEN NARRATOLOGIE

Alexandra Strohmaier, Graz, Österreich

Im Unterschied zu Positionen der pragmatischen Narratologie, deren Prämissen sich auf Austins Trichotomie lokutionär / illokutionär / perlokutionär zurückführen lassen, sucht dieser Beitrag, Austins initiale Performativ/konstativ-Unterscheidung als theoretischen Ausgangspunkt für eine performanz- bzw. performativitätstheoretische Profilierung der Narratologie nutzbar zu machen. Die Annahme einer (je)der Narration immanenten per¬formativen Dimension in Anschluss an poststrukturalistische Revisionen der Austinschen Theoriebildung eröffnet, wie gezeigt werden soll, neue Perspektiven für die Untersuchung der Wirkmächtigkeit narrativer Formen und Verfahren. Das theoretische und methodische Potential einer Integration performanztheoretischer Ansätze (poststrukturalistischer Pro¬venienz) und narratologischer Ansätze (strukturalistischer Provenienz) soll dabei konkret am Beispiel der in der klassischen Erzählforschung (zugunsten der Kategorie Zeit) margi¬nalisierten Kategorie des Raumes vorgeführt werden. Die Adaptierung handlungstheoreti¬scher Ansätze der Raumtheorie für die kulturwissenschaftliche Narratologie erlaubt es, den Fokus von der Frage nach der Repräsentation auf die nach der Konstitution des Raumes (in dem/durch den Akt der Narration) zu verschieben. Der gemeinhin als natürlich gegeben (und als in der Narration lediglich re-präsentiert) gedachte Raum wird auf seine narrrative Konstituierung hin untersucht.

WITTGENSTEIN, REFLEXIVITY AND THE SOCIAL CONSTRUCTION OF REALITY

Gavin Sullivan, Melbourne, Australia

Social constructionism is one of the main ways in which the influence of Wittgenstein's later philosophy is felt in psychology. This framework for a range of disparate conceptual and empirical activities encourages reflexivity about the linguistic and social construction of reality. However, critics have suggested that social constructionism's reflexivity leads to self-referential inconsistency. Hibberd (2005) also claims that some social constructionists who have been inspired by Wittgenstein's philosophy actually endorse a form of conventionalism compatible with early logical positivism. This paper examines three central themes. First, whether social constructionism in psychology can indeed be described as Wittgensteinian and metatheoretical without misrepresentation and confusion. Second, how social constructionists and their critics in psychology could engage properly with Wittgenstein's work (e.g., on mathematics and psychology) in order to be self-critical about the relationship between language, mind and the world. Third, do analyses demonstrate a need for a sociohistorical investigation because "it is not sufficient to show or even to demonstrate that a problem is a false problem in order to have done with it" (Bourdieu, 2004, p. 7).

THE TOPOLOGY OF EXISTENTIAL EXPERIENCE: WITTGENSTEIN AND DERRIDA (BETWEEN REALITY AND CONSTRUCTION)

Xymena Synak-Pskit, Gdańsk, Poland

If, as Wittgenstein postulates in Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus, the world is a compilation of facts not of things and, if a form of the world means the possibility of its structure, what is the possible form of the world like. What does it mean that the world, being a structure of state of affairs, is my world. Trying to, at least, look at a possible answer, we should reflect on the existential copula 'to be'.

If "to be" does not mean "to exist" but "to reflect a sentence" and if giving the essence of the sentence is to give the essence of the world, do we not have here a gesture aiming at synthetical compilation of some statements of Tractatus, such as:

1. Every defined sign can be deconstructed by other signs that defines it,

2. What is not expressed in signs, is shown in using them,

3. Logical statements describe the structure of the world and do not represent it,

4. And the thesis of Investigations which refers to a possible meaning of a sign as a sign of a certain activity resulting from its being placed in some factuality?

Taking the above statements into consideration we can say that every semiotic act of constitution is delayed and deferred and that the conception of facts as constituents of some external reality must be abandoned.

The term 'existential experience' reflects the non-possible constitution of referentiality.

PARTIZIPATION IN VIRTUELLEN WELTEN

Sabine Thürmel, München, Deutschland

Virtuelle Welten, also computer-basierte simulierte Umgebungen, sind Möglichkeitsräume, die die Produktion und Rezeption imaginärer Welten ermöglichen. Die in virtuellen Welten geschaffenen Erfahrungsräume bieten Spielräume zum kognitiven und kommunikativen Handeln sowie zur symbolischen Interaktion, also für Fähigkeiten, denen in unserer Epoche ein besonderer Stellenwert eingeräumt wird.

Die computer-basierte Interaktion und Kooperation der Akteure – von menschlichen Nutzern gesteuerte Avatare und reine Softwareagenten - ist nach dem Vorbild der Kooperation lebensweltlichen Handels modelliert, was am spielerischen Handeln und ökonomischen Handeln dargestellt wird.

In virtuellen Welten ist die Unterscheidung zwischen Mensch- und rein computergesteuerten Akteuren i.a. nicht mehr zweifelsfrei möglich, was einen rein anthropozentrischen Blickwinkel obsolet werden lässt. Es bestehen aber grundsätzliche Unterschiede zwischen der Handlungskraft der durch Menschen gesteuerten Avatare und der Softwareagenten. Dies wird am situationsbasierten Sprachhandeln und am spielerischen Wechsel zwischen der Interaktion in virtuellen Welten und der Teilhabe an deren Erstellung und Veränderung aufgezeigt.

WITTGENSTEIN, BRANDOM UND DER ANALYTISCHE PRAGMATISMUS

Stefan Tolksdorf, Berlin, Deutschland

Der vorliegende Aufsatz geht der Frage nach, in welcher Beziehung Brandoms analytischer Pragmatismus zur Spätphilosophie Wittgensteins steht. Die Antwort darauf ist geteilt. Eine Übereinstimmung besteht in der Konstruktion pragmatischer Geschichten, welche die Logik unserer Handlungsräume übersichtlicher darstellen sollen. Jedoch kann die Engführung auf algorithmische Abhängigkeiten zwischen Praktiken kaum mit Wittgenstein in Einklang gebracht werden. Ich plädiere deshalb für eine Ausweitung des analytischen Pragmatismus, hin zur systematischen Erfassung des hermeneutischen Verstehens.

SEARLE ON CONSTRUCTION OF REALITY: HOW WE CONSTRUCT CHAIRMEN AND DON'T CONSTRUCT CHAIRS

Pavla Toracova, Prague, Czech Republic

Institutional facts – for example the fact that there is a philosophical conference happening in Kirchberg, or that since January the unit of currency in Slovakia has been the euro – are objective facts that are constructed in the intentionality of human minds. According to John Searle, the key point in their construction is the assignment of a status function to a brute object. In this paper, I suggest that we should understand the construction of institutional facts not as based on the rather mysterious assignment of status function, but on a development of intentionality. This suggestion can be understood as an interpretation of Searle's theory of institutional reality presented in The Construction of Social Reality, and can help to understand Searle's recent development of this theory.

IN PURSUIT OF ORDINARY: PERFORMATIVITY IN JUDITH BUTLER AND J. L. AUSTIN

Aydan Turanli, Istanbul, Turkey

Judith Butler, in her book Excitable Speech: a Politics of the Performative, asserts that there are similarities between "ritualistic" and "ceremonial' characteristic of illocutionary acts in J.L. Austin and the concept of "interpellation" presented by L. Althusser. In a Derridean manner, she says that "ceremonial" character of illocutionary acts exceeds a single moment in time and is associated with "condensed historicity," therefore, every utterance is actually a "citation."

In this article, I discuss that Butler's correlation of Austin's speech act theory with an Althusserian concept of "interpellation" is imprecise because Austin restricts himself to immediate contextualism implying the total conditions involved at the time of utterance. Judith Butler, on the other hand, in an Althusserian manner, commits herself to socio-historically conditioned meanings. The first part of the article concentrates on Judith Butler's characterization of Austin; the second part is a critique of Butler's considerations.

CRISPIN WRIGHT'S ANTIREALISM AND NORMATIVITY OF TRUTH

Pasi Valtonen, Tampere, Finland

Crispin Wright aims to explore the realism - anti-realism debate with a conception of truth which is neutral concerning the debate. From this neutral starting point, he ends up defending dummettian anti-realism by demonstrating a close link between an epistemic constraint of truth and a normative aspect of truth. However a closer look at Wright's defense reveals a problem concerning the neutrality of truth. In a crucial part of his argumentation, he assumes truth to be realistic rather than neutral. My focus in this paper is to outline a solution to the problem. It turns out that Huw Price's idea is useful to my solution.

BEYOND THE WORLD, BEYOND SIGNIFICANT LANGUAGE

Nuno Venturinha, Lisbon, Portugal

In recent years, mainly due to the work of Cora Diamond and James Conant, there has been a lively debate around Wittgenstein's conceptions of ethics and nonsense. However, commentators have tended to focus primarily on the Tractatus, disregarding other important sources. One of them is the "Lecture on Ethics", where Wittgenstein astonishingly writes that "all [he] wanted to do with [his nonsensical expressions] was just to go beyond the world and that is to say beyond significant language". In this paper, I shall examine the two handwritten versions of the text, MSS 139a and b, in order to shed light on Wittgenstein's view. But I shall also look at the related remarks in the third manuscript volume, MS 107, as well

as at those recorded by Waismann published in Wittgenstein and the Vienna Circle. Particular attention will be paid to Wittgenstein's comments on Heidegger, which reappear in the so-called "Dictation to Schlick" (D 302).

WAS WITTGENSTEIN A NORMATIVIST ABOUT MEANING?

Claudine Verheggen, Toronto, Canada

I try to shed light on the ongoing debate concerning the question whether meaning is normative by returning to its sources in Wittgenstein's writings. I argue that, once we recognize, with Wittgenstein, that the conditions of correctness that govern the application of linguistic expressions are intrinsic to meaning and not to anything to which meaning could be reduced, we must conclude that there is a sense in which meaning is essentially normative. This, however, is not the sense usually attributed to Wittgenstein, according to which the conditions of correct application of expressions are themselves determined by rules.

SELBSTERKENNTNIS ALS TECHNOLOGIE DES SELBST: WITTGENSTEIN UND FOUCAULT ÜBER DIE PRAXIS DES PHILOSOPHIERENS.

Jörg Volbers, Berlin, Deutschland

Eine der Grundgedanken des Wittgenstein'schen Spätwerks ist das Primat der Praxis: Um Wörter und Handlungen zu verstehen, ist es unverzichtbar, selbst Teilnehmer an diesen Sprachspielen und ihrer Lebensform zu sein. Aus dieser Position heraus deutet Wittgenstein die philosophische Selbsterkenntnis, die Reflexion auf das eigene Sein und Tun, radikal um. Sie ist für ihn keine Erkenntnis eines Gegenstandes, sondern eine Form der „Arbeit an Einem selbst", wie er es nennt. In voller Konsequenz wird das Primat der Praxis auf die philosophische Erkenntnis selbst ausgeweitet: Philosophieren ist demnach kein kognitiver Akt, sondern eine praktische Übung. Die philosophische Einsicht ist für Wittgenstein verbunden mit einer auch körperlich gedachten Arbeit an der eigenen Wahrnehmung und an den eigenen Fähigkeiten.

Der Vortrag zeigt, dass diese Idee der Philosophie einen doppelten Grund hat. Zum einen ist sie eine systematische Konsequenz aus dem Primat der Praxis, die auch das Denken selbst als Praktik zu begreifen versucht. Dieser Philosophiebegriff reagiert auf ein methodisches Problem, auf das der theoretisch-kognitive Erkenntnisbegriff keine Antwort finden kann. Wittgensteins Philosophieverständnis steht andererseits in einer Tradition der „geistigen Übungen" (Hadot), die von der Antike bis zur frühen Neuzeit reichte. Mit Foucault formuliert, bestimmt Wittgenstein Philosophie als eine Selbsttechnik, als eine Praxis, die darauf zielt, das Verhältnis zu sich selbst zu transformieren. Aus dieser Perspektive zeichnet sich ein neues Bild des Philosophierens ab, das diese Praxis ethisch-politisch situiert, ohne sie in diesen Dimensionen aufgehen zu lassen.

SHOULD ESSENTIALISM ABOUT LAWS OF NATURE IMPLY STRONG NECESSITY?

Miklavž Vospernik, Maribor, Slovenia

Dispositional essentialism about laws of nature (Ellis, Bird) implies necessity of natural laws. In particular, dispositional essentialists have two versions of necessetarianism to consider – a weaker and a stronger one. We shall argue that the weaker version is indeed a very weak version, for it must allow for a general interrelatedness of nomic properties, or limit itself to the so-called fundamental nomic properties. So, the more demanding and seemingly intuitively less plausible strong necessetarianism is the more viable alternative.

ON THE LINGUISTIC TURN, AGAIN: A RORTIAN NOTE ON THE 'WILLIAMSON/HACKER-CONTROVERSY'

Timo Vuorio, Tampere, Finland

Timothy Williamson and Peter Hacker have recently disputed if the 'linguistic turn' in philosophy has been coming into end or not. In this paper their 'controversy' is discussed from a point of view offered by Richard Rorty's pragmatism. Here the linguistic turn is associated with the problem of representation, and how the relation between mental and linguistic versions of it is to be seen. A 'Rortian' will find certain aspects in both of their views agreeable, but radically opposing some others as well. However, the outcome of the paper is to point out that the differences in the controversy reflect deeper metaphilosophical commitments; the issue in hand is very much the 'Kantian' legacy of philosophy.

„ES IST EIN BEISPIEL, BEI DEM MAN GEDANKEN HABEN KANN.": WITTGENSTEIN LIEST HEBEL

DAVID WAGNER, WIEN, ÖSTERREICH

Johann Peter Hebel (1760–1826), deutscher Dichter, evangelischer Theologe und Pädagoge, gilt als einer der „Lieblingsschriftsteller" Ludwig Wittgensteins (McGuinness 1983, XIII). Die Liste jener, die Peter Hebel bewunderten, ist lang: So finden sich Goethe, die Brüder Grimm, Gottfried Keller und Leo Tolstoi – alles Autoren, die Wittgenstein schätzte und immer wieder las – unter ihnen.

Dieser Beitrag dokumentiert zunächst die Quellenlage zu Wittgensteins Hebel-Lektüre, um anschließend die Funktion von Hebels Erzählungen im Nachlass zu beleuchten.

THE INTERLOCUTOR EQUIVOCATION

Ben Walker, Norwich, United Kingdom

The way in which one understands the role of the interlocutorial voice has a number of acute consequences upon how one more generally conceives of Wittgenstein's later method. Its cadence and style are often interpreted in demonstrative terms, with the interlocutor representative of the potential, actual or nascent tendencies that lead people

into philosophically problematic territory. This paper offers a reading where the interlocutor is understood as the expression of the author's own disquiets; a record of his work upon (and interrogation of) himself. In such a reading the way in which the word "interlocutor" is sometimes used in modern therapeutic literature becomes markedly problematic. Specifically, to describe the philosopher whom one is engaged with in dialogue as one's "interlocutor" becomes a troubling act, one in which an equivocation takes place between a literary technique used to give voice to one's own impulses and expectations, and one's actual partner in dialogue.

UNSHADOWED ANTI-REALISM

Adam Wallace, Cambridge, United Kingdom

Charles Travis has claimed that the moral of much of Wittgenstein's philosophy of language is that there are no shadows, ways of representing "which determine [...] all that is determined as to when what so represented would be true (or false)" (Travis 2008, pp.147-8). Travis takes this to undermine another influential reading of Wittgenstein's work, Michael Dummett's revisionist anti-realism. This paper argues that, on the contrary, even given the impossibility of shadows, revisionist anti-realism is still a live option.

NO NONSENSE WITTGENSTEIN

Thomas Wallgren, Helsinki, Finland

A landscape is presented in which the difficulty of receiving Wittgenstein, the therapeutic interpretation of his work and the difficulty of receiving the therapeutic interpretation are reference points. Cora Diamond is singled out as one important representative of the therapeutic interpretation. Her ideas about the lasting importance that Wittgenstein attached to the philosophy of logic and Wittgenstein's enduring allegiance to a Fregean distinction between the logical and the psychological are introduced and some details of her argument are examined critically. In the light of the foregoing it is suggested that some problems endemic to the therapeutic reading of Wittgenstein can be resolved if we attend to the advantages of the polyphonic mode characteristic of his Philosophical Investigations, Part 1.

UND DAS SELBST GIBT ES DOCH – VERSUCH DER VERTEIDIGUNG EINES UMSTRITTENEN KONZEPTS

Patricia M. Wallusch, Frankfurt am Main, Deutschland

Discussions on the self in contemporary analytical philosophy are usually treated as being ambiguous. The range of issues concerns metaphysical and epistemological questions or questions whether the self refers to a real phenomenon as well as complaints about the theoretical uselessness of such a concept – whose advocates regard the concept of the self as a source of (linguistic) confusion.

My very aim in this proposal is to defend the concept of the self against some recent criticism and to show in contrast that it refers in fact to an important aspect of reality and of contemporary philosophy of mind as well: the subject and interrelated issues.

COGNITION IN THE WORLD? FUNCTIONALISM AND EXTENDED COGNITION

Sven Walter / Lena Kästner, Osnabrück, Germany

According to the so-called extended cognition hypothesis, there are conditions under which (the material vehicles that realize) thinking and thought or, more generally, cognition, are not located wholly within an individual's head, but spatially distributed over brain, body and world. We start by considering two possible arguments for the hypothesis radical that cognition is, or may possibly be, extended in such a way. Both arguments, although quite prominent in the debate about extended cognition, fail. We then consider a recent attempt due to Fred Adams and Ken Aizawa to show that cognitive processes cannot be extended, but must rather be brainbound. Their argument, we argue, also fails; and seeing why it fails allows us to identify the outlines of a positive argument for the hypothesis of extended cognition that—given that the arguments usually advanced in its favor don't work—is needed.

KEIN DENKEN OHNE REDEN? ANMERKUNGEN ZU EINIGEN ARGUMENTEN FÜR DEN BEGRIFFLICHEN ZUSAMMENHANG VON INTENTIONALITÄT UND SPRACHFÄHIGKEIT

Heinrich Watzka, Frankfurt am Main, Deutschland

Die Mehrzahl analytischer Autoren geht davon aus, dass sich die Bedeutung sprachlicher Zeichen durch den Inhalt intentionaler Zustände erklären lässt, und nicht umgekehrt. Nur wenige Autoren, darunter Davidson und Brandom, räumen weder dem Denken noch dem Reden einen begrifflichen Vorrang ein. Beide haben beeindruckende Argumente für den Zusammenhang von Intentionalität und Sprachfähigkeit vorgelegt, die in ihren zentralen Prämissen - die Gleichsetzung von bewusstem Glauben und höherstufigem Glauben und Inferentialismus - anfechtbar sind. In einem letzten Anlauf soll gefragt werden, was Wittgenstein zu diesem Thema beizutragen hat.

WISSENDE UND ZWEIFELNDE - WITTGENSTEINS "DOPPELANGRIFF"

Anja Weiberg, Wien, Österreich

Einer der interessantesten Aspekte in Über Gewißheit ist Wittgensteins Zurückweisung sowohl des Mooreschen „Wissens" als auch des skeptischen Zweifels durch den Hinweis auf eine Gemeinsamkeit des Gebrauchs der Wörter „zweifeln" und „wissen" und die Forderung nach einer Rechtfertigung nicht nur für einen Wissensanspruch, sondern ebenso für die Artikulation eines Zweifels. Wie er hierbei konkret vorgeht, soll im Rahmen des Vortrags näher erläutert werden.

SHOULD THE LANGUAGE OF LOGIC DICTATE REALITY?

Paul Weingartner, Salzburg, Austria

The purpose of the paper is to show (1) that Classical Logic (CL) does and (2) why it does and (3) that therefore some suitable restrictions have to be put on CL in order to still be widely applicable.

BEDEUTUNGSERLEBNIS AND LEBENSGEFÜHL IN KANT AND WITTGENSTEIN: RESPONSIBILITY AND THE FUTURE.

Christian Helmut Wenzel, Taipei, Taiwan

This essay is about the inner and the outer in Wittgenstein, in particular his notion of "meaning experience". Wittgenstein reminds us that we should not think of the inner psychological side the way we think about the outer, physical world. Again and again he keeps returning to certain views about the soul and our mental states. This makes me think that it is not only therapy he has in mind. I will contrast certain aesthetic and ethical aspects of his thoughts with views from Kant.

WITTGENSTEIN'S ACTIVITY: THE TRACTATUS AS AN "ESOTERIC" DEFENSE OF POETRY

John Westbrook, Milwaukee, WI, USA

In the Republic, Socrates states that "there is from of old a quarrel between philosophy and poetry" (607d). This ancient quarrel will be addressed indirectly through a subtle reading of Wittgenstein's Tractatus. The focus of this paper is to show that the inherent paradoxical nature of the Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus is not paradoxical at all. In order to establish this conclusion, I will argue two main theses: the first is that the Tractatus is not a composed of propositions, a doctrine, nor a theory of anything. Hand-in-hand with the first point is the second: that the Tractatus is not a piece of direct communication, but a poetic piece of indirect-communication. There are two important implications of this argument: (1) that the Tractatus is, indeed, an ethical work – just as Wittgenstein claimed it was; and (2) that literature (or "poetry," broadly understood) is a legitimate form of "expressing" certain kinds of truths.

A NOTE ON WITTGENSTEIN'S TRACTATUS AND TOLSTOY'S GOSPEL IN BRIEF

Peter K. Westergaard, Copenhagen, Denmark

This paper seeks a closer understanding of the form and numbering system of the Tractatus via a consideration of the preface to Tolstoy's Gospel in Brief (Kurze Darlegung des Evangelium = KD). Wittgenstein was familiar with Tolstoy's introductory remarks concerning the composition and inherent structure of the Gospel in Brief. Tolstoy's "magnificent work" was among the works Wittgenstein read while working on the Tractatus.

ZUR AUTORITÄT DER ZWEITEN PERSON/THE AUTHORITY OF A SECOND PERSON

Lutz Wingert, Zürich, Schweiz/Switzerland

WITTGENSTEIN AND THE UNWRITTEN PART OF THE TRACTATUS

Feng-Wei Wu, Taipei, Taiwan

In a well-known letter to Ludwig Ficker, Wittgenstein mentions that there is an unwritten part of his Tractatus, and it is this unwritten part that actually matters. What is this unwritten part? What does Wittgenstein try to convey in this unwritten part? Why is it unwritten? I argue that this unwritten part is his view on ethics. If we read the Tractatus carefully, it would become crystal clear that Wittgenstein is nowhere near to moral indifferentism or moral emotivism. But Wittgenstein does hold the view that ethics is ineffable, for our language is limited in nature. I also argue that, to Wittgenstein, it is actually its being unwritten that ethics could be meaningfully being talked about.

THOUGH THIS BE LANGUAGE, YET THERE IS REALITY IN'T: PRICHARD AND WITTGENSTEIN ON ETHICS.

Anna Zielinska, Grenoble, France

Moore's Pricipia Ethica received, at the beginning of the Twentieth Century, two major criticisms, the first from H.A. Prichard, the second from L. Wittgenstein. Those philosophers advance several new ideas about morality, and their works show that there is a fundamental link between moral sphere and epistemology; it seems that some of the mistakes proper to this second domain are even more striking when repeated within the first. This paper tries to make explicit a number of points of convergence between Wittgenstein and Prichard, hoping to show that moral philosophy goes in pair with the study of the uses of language in a very broad sense, since this – and not the psychological sphere – is the place where it is at home.

Leben.Begleiten

Raiffeisen-
eine Wertegemeinschaft
von Menschen
mit Verantwortung
für Menschen.

Mit.Einander

Raiffeisen -
eine gelebte Philosophie,
die den Schutz und die
Förderung des Einzelnen
und seines regionalen
Lebensraumes zum Ziel hat.

**Raiffeisenbank
NÖ-Süd Alpin**